

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
DEPARTMENT OF STATE
BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS

F I N A L M I N U T E S

MEETING OF:

**STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS**

TIME: 10:30 A.M.

Held at

PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE

2525 North 7th Street

CoPA HUB, Eaton Conference Room

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110

as well as

VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS

Thursday, September 12, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

ALSO PRESENT: (Cont.)

Rita Yannayon, CPE, President, Assessors' Association
of Pennsylvania
Rachel Wilbur-Adams, Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

1 ***

2 State Board of Certified
3 Real Estate Appraisers
4 September 12, 2024

5 ***

6 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act,
7 at 9:00 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session
8 with Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, to have
9 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of
10 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations. The Board
11 returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.]

12 ***

13 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, informed
14 everyone that the meeting of the State Board of
15 Certified Real Estate Appraisers was being held in a
16 hybrid format, in person and by livestreaming
17 teleconference, pursuant to Act 100 of 2021, which
18 requires boards to use a virtual platform to conduct
19 business when a public meeting is held.

20 Mr. Rouse noted the meeting was being recorded
21 and voluntary participation constituted consent to
22 being recorded.

23 Mr. Rouse also noted the Board entered into
24 Executive Session with Board Counsel to have
25 attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of

1 conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.]

2 ***

3 The regularly scheduled meeting of the State
4 Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers was held on
5 Thursday, September 12, 2024. Mark V. Smeltzer Sr.,
6 Chairman, Professional Member, officially called the
7 meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

8 ***

9 Roll Call

10 [Mark V. Smeltzer Sr., Chairman, Professional Member,
11 requested a roll call of Board members. A quorum was
12 noted to be present.]

13 ***

14 Introduction of Attendees

15 [Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator,
16 provided an introduction of attendees.

17 Mr. Edger introduced Laura Pittini as the new
18 designee on behalf of the Attorney General.

19 Mr. Rouse welcomed Ms. Pittini.]

20 ***

21 Approval of minutes of the August 1, 2024 meeting

22 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

23 Has everyone had a chance to look over
24 the minutes from the last meeting? Any
25 questions or discussion?

1 Can I get a motion to accept the
2 minutes?

3 MR. AUSHERMAN:

4 I so move.

5 MR. STOERRLE:

6 Second.

7 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

8 We'll do a roll call vote.

9

10 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;
11 Michael McFarlane, aye; John Ausherman,
12 aye; Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan
13 Schuck, aye; Scott Hartman, aye; Paul
14 Edger, aye.

15 [The motion carried unanimously.]

16 ***

17 Report of Prosecutorial Division - No Report

18 ***

19 Report of Board Counsel - Motion to Deem Facts

20 Admitted

21 and Enter Default

22 MR. ROUSE:

23 Item 2 on the agenda is the Motion to
24 Deem Facts Admitted and Enter Default
25 for BPOA v. Richard Owens, Case No. 23-

1 70-013861.

2 Regarding that matter, I believe
3 the Chair would entertain a motion to
4 grant the Motion to Deem Facts Admitted
5 and to direct Board Counsel to prepare
6 the Adjudication and Order in
7 accordance with the discussions in
8 Executive Session.

9 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

10 I would entertain such a motion.

11 MR. MCFARLANE:

12 So moved.

13 MR. EDGER:

14 I second.

15 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

16 Roll call voting.

17

18 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;
19 Michael McFarlane, aye; John Ausherman,
20 aye; Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan
21 Schuck, aye; Scott Hartman, aye; Paul
22 Edger, aye.

23 [The motion carried unanimously.]

24 ***

25 Report of Board Counsel - Adjudication and Order

1 MR. ROUSE:

2 Item 3 on the agenda is a Final
3 Adjudication and Order in the Matter of
4 the Petition for Reinstatement of the
5 Certified Residential Real Estate
6 Appraiser License of Eugene Peter
7 Kenworthy, Case No. 24-70-006783.

8 I believe the Chair would entertain
9 a motion to adopt the Adjudication and
10 Order as presented by Board Counsel and
11 to direct Board Counsel to prepare the
12 Board's Final Order.

13 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

14 I would entertain a motion.

15 MR. AUSERMAN:

16 I so move.

17 MS. MAST:

18 I second.

19 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

20 We'll do a roll call vote.

21

22 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, no;
23 Michael McFarlane, aye; John Auserman,
24 aye; Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan
25 Schuck, aye; Scott Hartman, aye; Paul

1 Edger, aye.

2 [The motion carried. Bill Stoerrle opposed the
3 motion.]

4 ***

5 Regulations/Statute - Regulatory Report

6 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, provided a
7 Regulatory Status Report for the Board's review.]

8 ***

9 Regulations/Statute - Regulation 16A-7025 (Fees)

10 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, stated the
11 annex for Regulation 16A-7025 regarding fees was
12 released as an exposure draft on July 29, 2024. He
13 noted stakeholders were to submit written comments by
14 September 9, 2024, and the Board did not receive any
15 comments.]

16 MR. ROUSE:

17 Would the Chair entertain a motion to
18 adopt the proposed annex and direct
19 regulatory counsel to draft the
20 preamble?

21 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

22 I would entertain such a motion.

23 MR. STOERRLE:

24 I make a motion.

25 MR. HARTMAN:

1 I'll second.

2 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

3 Roll call voting.

4

5 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;

6 Michael McFarlane, aye; John Ausherman,

7 aye; Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan

8 Schuck, aye; Scott Hartman, aye; Paul

9 Edger, aye.

10 [The motion carried unanimously.]

11 ***

12 Regulations/Statute - Regulation 16A-7029 (Distance
13 Education and PAREA)

14 [Ronald K. Rouse, Esquire, Board Counsel, addressed
15 Regulation 16A-7029 regarding distance education and
16 Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal
17 (PAREA). He noted the Board received one public
18 comment from the Appraisal Institute that was
19 discussed at the last meeting. He also noted the
20 Independent Regulatory Review Commission (IRRC)
21 released its suggestions concerning the proposed
22 rulemaking on August 28, 2024, in terms of clarifying
23 certain issues in the proposed regulation for the
24 final rulemaking package.

25 Mr. Rouse informed Board members that he will be

1 answering questions for the final rulemaking package
2 and then bring that back to the Board for review and
3 a vote.

4 Chair Smeltzer noted appreciation for the
5 Appraisal Institute's letters and thanked Mr.
6 DiBiasio for pointing out the Board needed to address
7 the matter with the mentors of the PAREA program.]

8 ***
9 Report of Board Chairman - No Report

10 ***
11 Report of Board Administrator
12 [Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator,
13 requested Board approval of the proposed 2027 Board
14 meeting dates to include January 21, March 4, April
15 15, May 27, July 15, August 26, October 7, and
16 December 2.]

17 MR. ROUSE:

18 Would the Chair entertain a motion to
19 adopt the 2027 proposed Board meeting
20 dates?

21 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

22 I would entertain such a motion.

23 MR. AUSHERMAN:

24 I so move.

25 MR. STOERRLE:

1 Second.

2 MS. HENNESSY HEMLER:

3 Roll call voting.

4

5 Mark Smeltzer, aye; Bill Stoerrle, aye;
6 Michael McFarlane, aye; John Ausherman,
7 aye; Chandra Mast, aye; Jonathan
8 Schuck; Scott Hartman, aye; Paul Edger,
9 aye.

10 [The motion carried. Jonathan Schuck experienced
11 technical difficulties.]

12 ***

13 Report of Committees - Revisions to Experience Logs
14 [R. Scott Hartman, Professional Member, informed
15 Board members that there will be a second committee
16 meeting on September 23 at 2 p.m. and intends to
17 bring back revisions for the full Board's
18 consideration on October 24, 2024.]

19 ***

20 Miscellaneous - Update Regarding September 4, 2024
21 Appraisal Subcommittee (ASC) Priority Contact
22 Meeting

23 [Kristel Hennessy Hemler, Board Administrator,
24 informed Board members that she and Mr. Rouse had a
25 meeting with their Appraisal Subcommittee Policy

1 Manager, Neal Fenochietti, on September 4, 2024. She
2 explained that priority contact meetings happen on
3 the off year of their federal audit.

4 Ms. Hennessy Hemler announced their compliance
5 review dates for 2025 will be August 12 through
6 August 14 and is when the policy managers ask for
7 different applications, prosecution materials, and
8 speak with Mr. Rouse regarding regulations. She
9 mentioned they will also be attending the July 17,
10 2025 Board meeting as part of the compliance review.]

11 ***

12 Public Comment

13 [William T. Stoerrle Jr., Vice Chairman, Professional
14 Member, referred to some of the local Multiple
15 Listing Services (MLSs) removing all of the photos
16 from the property except the front view once the
17 property is sold because of concern for the safety of
18 the new property owner. He asked whether that is
19 from the Pennsylvania Association of Realtors (PAR)
20 or National Association of Realtors (NAR) or just a
21 particular MLS doing that.

22 Emme Reiser, Political Programs Manager,
23 Pennsylvania Association of Realtors, explained that
24 it is not a directive that PAR or NAR gave and
25 assumed it is from the MLS but offered to look into

1 that issue.]

2 ***

3 Adjournment

4 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

5 Could I have a motion to adjourn?

6 MS. MAST:

7 So moved.

8 MR. EDGER:

9 I'll second.

10 CHAIRMAN SMELTZER:

11 We are adjourned.

12 ***

13 [There being no further business, the State Board of
14 Certified Real Estate Appraisers Meeting adjourned at
15 10:49 a.m.]

16 ***

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Certified Real Estate Appraisers meeting.



Rachel Wilbur-Adams,
Minute Clerk
Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

STATE BOARD OF CERTIFIED
REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS
REFERENCE INDEX

September 12, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

TIME	AGENDA
9:00	Executive Session
10:30	Return to Open Session
10:30	Official Call to Order
10:31	Roll Call
10:31	Introduction of Attendees
10:33	Approval of Minutes
10:33	Report of Board Counsel
10:36	Regulations/Statute
10:41	Report of Board Administrator
10:43	Report of Committees
10:44	Miscellaneous
10:46	Public Comment/Discussion
10:49	Adjournment