1	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
2	DEPARTMENT OF STATE
3	BUREAU OF PROFESSIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL AFFAIRS
4	
5	
6	<u>FINAL MINUTES</u>
7	
8	MEETING OF:
9	
10	STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC
11	
12	TIME: 10:31 A.M.
13	
14	Held at
15	PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF STATE
16	2525 North 7th Street
17	CoPA HUB, Eaton Conference Room
18	Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17110
19	as well as
20	VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS
21	
22	April 18, 2024
23	
24	
25	

1

	2
1 2 3 4 5 6	State Board of Chiropractic April 18, 2024
4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 5 1 1 2 3 1 2 3 1 2 3 2 2 3 2 2 3 2 2 3 2 2 2 2	BOARD MEMBERS:
	William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson Matthew Eaton, Director of Operations, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, on behalf of Jonathan W. McCullough Jr., D.C., Secretary Ann R. Johnston, Senior Deputy Attorney General, Office of Attorney General, Consumer Protection Member Michael S. Swank, D.C. Brian Moreland, D.C.
	BUREAU PERSONNEL:
	 Carole Clarke Smith, Esquire, Senior Board Counsel Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Regulatory Board Counsel J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor and Prosecution Liaison William A. Newport, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor Adrianne McClendon, Esquire, Board Prosecutor Kelsey B. Ashworth, Esquire, Board Prosecutor Shakeena Chappelle, Board Administrator
31 32	ALSO PRESENT:
32 334 35 367 39 41 42 45 46 49 50	Keith Miller, D.C., President, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association Liliana Fisher, Esquire, CGA Law Firm Doug Babin, CPCU, AIC, CIFI, FCLS, State Farm Insurance Companies Special Investigative Unit President- Pennsylvania Auto Crime Investigator's Association Stephanie Dunkerley Mike Barba, Executive Director, Pennsylvania Chiropractic Association Ted Mowatt, CAE, Vice President, Wanner Associates, on behalf of the of the Chiropractor Fellowship of Pennsylvania George E. Khoury, D.C., District III Director, Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards Fabio Sciarrino, Esquire, Marks, O'Neill, O'Brien, Doherty & Kelly

	3	3
1	State Board of Chiropractic	
2 3	April 18, 2024	
4 5	ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)	
$1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \\ 4 \\ 5 \\ 6 \\ 7 \\ 8 \\ 9 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 2 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 1$	ALSO PRESENT: (cont.) James J. Kutz, Esquire, Co-Chair of the Appellate Department/Chair of the Regulatory & Administrative Agency Law and Professional Licensure Practice Groups, Post & Schell, P.C. Kay Sophia Mahoney, Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.	
49 50 51		
I		

Г

4 * * * 1 2 State Board of Chiropractic 3 April 18, 2024 * * * 4 5 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 9:30 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session 6 7 with Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the 8 purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations 9 and to receive the advice of counsel. The Board 10 returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.] * * * 11 Official Call to Order 12 13 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, called the 14 meeting of the State Board of Chiropractic to order 15 at 10:31 a.m.] * * * 16 Introduction of Board Members and Attendees 17 18 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, requested an introduction of Board members and attendees. A 19 20 quorum of Board members was present.] * * * 21 22 [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, informed 23 everyone that the meeting was being recorded, and 24 those who continued to participate were giving their 25 consent to be recorded.

1 Mr. Jayman also noted the Board entered into 2 Executive Session for the purpose of conducting 3 quasi-judicial deliberations on a number of matters 4 currently pending before the Board and to receive the 5 advice of counsel.] * * * 6 7 Approval of minutes of the February 8, 2024 meeting 8 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 9 Approval of the minutes from the 10 February 8, 2024 meeting. Could we have a motion to approve 11 minutes of February 8, 2024, of the 12 13 State Board of Chiropractic? 14 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 15 So moved. DR. SWANK: 16 17 Second. 18 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 19 Could we have a roll call vote on 20 approval of the minutes of February 8? 21 22 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Director of 23 Operations Eaton, abstain; Dr. 24 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 25 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye.

5

1 [The motion carried. Matthew Eaton abstained from 2 voting on the motion.] 3 * * * 4 Report of Prosecution 5 [J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Prosecutor and Board Prosecution Liaison, presented the Consent 6 7 Agreement for Case No. 19-43-006607. 8 Dr. McCullough asked whether the practice was 9 incorporated, and Mr. Geschwindt did not believe it 10 was incorporated. He also asked whether it is 11 defined under § 5.81(2)(ii) that hiring an associate 12 to cover their practice is a breach of moral 13 turpitude. 14 Mr. Geschwindt did not believe it is defined in 15 that section, noting the problem was not that she 16 employed another chiropractor but that she was having the individual bill under her name to insurance 17 18 providers. He further explained that billing it 19 under her practice under the individual's name would 20 have been fine, but she was reported it to insurance 21 companies as if she performed the work. 22 Mr. Jayman asked whether Board members wished to 23 return to Executive Session to discuss item 2, and 24 they agreed to return to Executive Session.] * * * 25

6

[Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, 1 2 at 10:37 a.m. the Board entered into Executive 3 Session with Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, 4 for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial 5 deliberations and to receive the advice of counsel 6 regarding item 2 on the agenda. The Board returned 7 to open session at 10:44 a.m.] * * * 8 9 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 10 We came to an agreement in Executive 11 Session that we would like to forego a 12 decision. We rejected it as being too 13 harsh after discussion in Executive 14 Session, Case No. 19-43-006607. 15 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 16 Second. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 17 18 We're going to take a roll call vote. 19 20 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Director of 21 Operations Eaton, yes; Dr. McCullough, 22 aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. Swank, aye; 23 Dr. Moreland, aye. 24 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 25

7

[J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Prosecutor and 1 2 Board Prosecution Liaison, presented the Consent 3 Agreement for Case No. 22-43-013608.] CHAIR AUKERMAN: 4 5 For item 22-43-013608, do we have a motion to approve the Consent Agreement 6 7 and Order? 8 DR. SWANK: 9 I move that we accept the Consent 10 Agreement. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 11 12 Do we have a second? 13 DR. MORELAND: I'll second. 14 15 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 16 Could we have a roll call vote, 17 Shakeena? 18 19 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 20 McCullough, nay; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 21 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. [The motion carried. Jonathan McCullough opposed the 22 23 motion. The Respondent's name is Nicholas Andrew 24 Puccio, D.C.] 25 * * *

8

1 [William A. Newport, Esquire, Senior Board 2 Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for Case 3 No. 23-43-018561.] * * * 4 5 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 6 We would like to entertain a motion to 7 approve the Consent Agreement and Order at Case No. 23-43-018561. 8 9 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 10 So moved. DR. SWANK: 11 12 Second. 13 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 14 Could we have a roll call vote, 15 Shakeena? 16 17 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 18 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 19 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 20 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's 21 name is Jon E. Rumbaugh, D.C.] * * * 22 23 [William A. Newport, Esquire, Senior Board 24 Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for Case 25 No. 20-43-012326.]

CHAIR AUKERMAN: 1 2 We would like to entertain a motion to 3 approve the Consent Agreement and Order at Case No. 20-43-012326. 4 5 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 6 So moved. 7 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 8 Do we have a second? 9 DR. SWANK: 10 Second. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 11 12 Roll call vote, Shakeena. 13 14 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 15 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 16 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 17 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's 18 name is Kenneth Kulback, D.C.] * * * 19 20 [Adrianne Rachelle McClendon, Esquire, Board 21 Prosecutor, presented the Consent Agreement for Case 22 No. 22-43-000224.] 23 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 24 I would like to make a motion of the 25 Board to approve Case No. 22-43-000224.

11 1 Do we have a motion? 2 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 3 So moved. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 4 5 Do we have a second? DR. SWANK: 6 7 Second. 8 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 9 Roll call vote, Shakeena. 10 11 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 12 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 13 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 14 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondent's 15 name is Daniel McClimon, D.C.] * * * 16 Report of Acting Commissioner - No Report 17 * * * 18 19 Report of Board Counsel - No Report * * * 20 21 Report of Board Chair - CCE Correspondence 22 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, addressed 23 correspondence received since the last Board meeting 24 from Craig Little, the President of the Council on 25 Chiropractic Education. He noted Dr. Little put out

a statement for immediate release that any 1 2 chiropractic residency programs or doctorate 3 chiropractic programs in the United States, Canada, 4 and territories must be in compliance with the 5 Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE). 6 Chair Aukerman believed the statement is based on 7 the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center (UPMC) 8 starting a chiropractic program in 2025. He noted it 9 would cover residency programs, but they wanted to 10 get this on the record that it will fall under CCE 11 guidance and approval.] * * * 12 13 Report of Board Chair - Affiliated Monitors 14 Correspondence 15 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, referred to 16 correspondence from Affiliated Monitors informing the 17 Board that of their availability to provide services. 18 He noted Affiliated Monitors has been monitoring 19 individuals who have some type of violation but are 20 still able to practice under guidance.] * * * 21 Report of Board Chair - NBCE Call for Board Member 22 23 Nominations 24 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, addressed 25 the National Board of Chiropractic Examiners call for

1 board member nominations. He noted that anyone who 2 is interested can go to their website and send a 3 letter of intent.] * * * 4 5 Report of Board Chair - Acute Neck and Back Pain 6 Protocol Correspondence 7 [William D. Aukerman, D.C., Chairperson, referred to 8 correspondence asking whether the Board had any 9 guidance on treatment protocols. He mentioned that 10 Dr. Homa is trying to form a treatment protocol for a 11 VA Hospital in Philadelphia and subsequent virtual and home-based education. He noted Dr. Homa wanted 12 13 to know if the state Board had any guidance on acute 14 neck and back pain protocol. 15 Mr. Jayman stated the Board does give advisory 16 opinions on treatment protocols. 17 Chair Aukerman asked Ms. Chappelle to construct a 18 short letter responding to Dr. Homa's 19 correspondence.] 20 * * * 21 Report of Board Administrator 22 [Shakeena L. Chappelle, Board Administrator, 23 requested Board approval for 2025 Board meeting 24 dates. 25 Dr. Moreland mentioned that Board meetings are

13

typically on Thursday and referred to June 13, 2025 1 2 being on a Friday. 3 Ms. Chappelle explained that June 12 was already 4 taken by another board but offered to have the Board 5 be notified if June 12, 2025 becomes available.] CHAIR AUKERMAN: 6 7 We're going to have a roll call vote to 8 approve those dates with the exception 9 of a possible change from June 13 to 10 June 12. 11 Could we have a motion to approve those dates outside of the June date? 12 13 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 14 So moved. 15 DR. SWANK: 16 Second. CHAIR AUKERMAN: 17 18 Shakeena. 19 20 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 21 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 22 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 23 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 24 25 Report of Regulatory Board Counsel - Status of

1 Regulations

1	Regulations	
2	[Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, provided a	
3	regulatory update on behalf of Thomas M. Davis,	
4	Esquire, Regulatory Board Counsel. He informed Board	
5	members that Mr. Davis is with the Independent	
6	Regulatory Review Commission (IRRC) presenting the	
7	chiropractor fee regulation, which is the only update	
8	to the report.	
9	Mr. Jayman noted the regulation would then be	
10	sent to the Office of Attorney General and the	
11	Legislative Reference Bureau (LRB) for approval and	
12	ultimately published as final in the Pennsylvania	
13	Bulletin if IRRC approves the regulation.]	
тJ		
14	***	
14	* * *	
14 15	*** New Business	
14 15 16	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to	
14 15 16 17	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider	
14 15 16 17 18	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications.	
14 15 16 17 18 19	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications. Ms. Chappelle explained that continuing education	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications. Ms. Chappelle explained that continuing education applications must be submitted separately for the	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	<pre>*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications. Ms. Chappelle explained that continuing education applications must be submitted separately for the same course occurring on different dates in different</pre>	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications. Ms. Chappelle explained that continuing education applications must be submitted separately for the same course occurring on different dates in different locations. She noted the need for a discussion or	
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	*** New Business [Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, referred to approving continuing education (CE) course provider applications. Ms. Chappelle explained that continuing education applications must be submitted separately for the same course occurring on different dates in different locations. She noted the need for a discussion or vote on submitting only one application for a course	

1	start date, but the end date would default to
2	September 1 of the biennial year, along with not
3	having to submit separate applications for separate
4	locations.]
5	MR. JAYMAN:
6	Based on Shakeena's presentation, it's
7	my understanding with respect to
8	applications for CE course approval
9	that the Chair would accept a motion to
10	direct Board staff to modify the CE
11	course approval application process as
12	follows: When the Board approves any
13	application for CE course approval, it
14	is approved for the entire biennial
15	renewal period unless the course
16	provider makes material changes of the
17	course material. It is approved for
18	all dates and locations listed on the
19	application.
20	DR. MCCULLOUGH:
21	So moved.
22	DR. SWANK:
23	Second.
24	CHAIR AUKERMAN:
25	Roll call vote, Shakeena.

1 2 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 3 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 4 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 5 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 6 7 Miscellaneous 8 [James Kutz, Esquire, Co-Chair of the Appellate 9 Department/Chair of the Regulatory & Administrative 10 Agency Law and Professional Licensure Practice 11 Groups, Post & Schell, P.C., presented to the Board to address Case No. 18-43-011786. He stated the 12 13 Board substantially modified a hearing officer's 14 recommended decision several months ago concerning 15 allegations related to boundary issues. 16 Mr. Kutz explained that part of that 17 recommendation was for the doctor to get continuing 18 education, along with a monetary penalty. He 19 reported having a fiduciary duty to the client but 20 not being able to speak with the client in two years. 21 He noted it to be his understanding from a family 22 member that his client also had civil litigations 23 brought against him. He reported his client to be 24 destitute and living in a home. 25 Mr. Kutz did not want to be guilty of not

1 ensuring compliance with the Board's recommended 2 decision and did not want to file a petition to 3 withdraw to chronicle these matters in a public 4 filing. He wanted to advise the Board, as counsel 5 for Dr. Larry S., that he had no means to reach the 6 doctor and asked the Board to review the CE 7 requirements and the fines.

Mr. Kutz noted Board Counsel has the docket 8 9 number and the adjudication number and wanted to see 10 if there was something the Board could do, possibly 11 by amending the adjudication somehow to keep his 12 license expired. He commented that his client is in 13 violation of the order but needed to bring the matter 14 to the Board's attention for his client's benefit and 15 his own ethical duty.

Chair Aukerman informed Mr. Kutz that the Board 16 would deliberate in Executive Session and have a 17 18 decision upon their return to open session.] * * * 19 20 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, 21 at 11:16 a.m. the Board entered into Executive 22 Session with Shawn J. Jayman, Esquire, Board Counsel, 23 for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial 24 deliberations and to receive the advice of counsel. 25 The Board returned to open session at 11:19 a.m.]

> Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc. (814) 536-8908

18

* * * 1 2 MR. JAYMAN: 3 Based on Executive Session 4 deliberations regarding matter 13 on 5 the agenda, it's my understanding that the Chair would entertain a motion to 6 7 deny the request for modification of 8 the civil penalty and CE requirements 9 for Case No. 18-43-011786. 10 CHAIR AUKERMAN: I would like to have a motion to deny 11 12 the request of the Respondent. 13 DR. MCCULLOUGH: 14 On the advice of counsel, so moved. 15 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 16 Second? DR. SWANK: 17 18 Second. 19 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 20 Roll call vote, Shakeena. 21 22 Dr. Aukerman, aye; Matt Eaton, aye; Dr. 23 McCullough, aye; Ann Johnston, aye; Dr. 24 Swank, aye; Dr. Moreland, aye. 25 [The motion carried unanimously.]

* * * 1 2 Old Business 3 [Jonathan W. McCullough Jr., D.C., Secretary, 4 referred to the number of chiropractic licensees for 5 the state of Pennsylvania presented at the last 6 meeting. He noted that the first number was 9,100 7 and the second number was 4,500 and requested a 8 correct number of active chiropractic licensees be 9 presented to the Board. 10 Ms. Chappelle offered to provide the Board with the correct number of licensees. She also informed 11 Board members that Ted Mowatt notified her that IRRC 12 13 approved the fee regulation.] * * * 14 15 Adjournment 16 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 17 I'd like to entertain a motion to 18 adjourn the meeting. MR. EATON: 19 20 Second. 21 CHAIR AUKERMAN: 22 We're adjourned. 23 * * * 24 [There being no further business, the State Board of 25 Chiropractic Meeting adjourned at 11:22 a.m.]

	21
1	* * *
2	
3	CERTIFICATE
4	
5	I hereby certify that the foregoing summary
6	minutes of the State Board of Chiropractic meeting,
7	was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision,
8	and that the minutes accurately summarize the
9	substance of the State Board of Chiropractic meeting.
10	
11	
12	gr m
13	Sophia Mahoney,
14	Minute Clerk
15	Sargent's Court Reporting
16	Service, Inc.
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	

		22
1 2		STATE BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC REFERENCE INDEX
2 3 4 5 6 7		April 18, 2024
	TIME	AGENDA
7 8 9 10	9:30 10:30	Executive Session Return to Open Session
10 11 12	10:31	Official Call to Order
12 13 14	10:32	Introduction of Board Members/Attendees
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	10:34	Approval of Minutes
	10:35	Report of Prosecution
	10:37 10:44	Executive Session Return to Open Session
	10:44	Report of Prosecution (cont.)
24	11:01	Report of Board Chair
25 26 27 28 29	11:06	Report of Board Administrator
	11:10	Report of Regulatory Board Counsel
30 31	11:11	New Business
31 32 33	11 : 14	Miscellaneous
34 35	11:16 11:19	Executive Session Return to Open Session
36 37 38	11:20	Old Business
30 39 40	11:22	Adjournment
40 41 42		
43 44		
45 46		
47 48		
49 50		