State Board of Massage Therapy April 2, 2024

1

BOARD MEMBERS:

Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair, Professional Member Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs

11 Linda A. Chamberlain, MS, BSN, RN, CNDLTC, Secretary 12 of Health designee 13

Jessica Nelson, Office of Attorney General designee Dana J. Douglas, LMT

14 15 Vickiann Hicks, LMT, BCTMB, CCCA 16

Jennifer A. Keth, LMT, CNC, Vice Chair Imelda Alumbro Shade, LMT

17 18 Bryan Strawser, LMT

19 20 21

BUREAU PERSONNEL:

22 23

Shana M. Walter, Esquire, Senior Board Counsel 24 Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel 25 Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Regulatory Board Counsel 26 J. Karl Geschwindt, Esquire, Senior Board Prosecutor

27 and Prosecution Liaison 28 Julius Zeitlinger, Esquire, Board Prosecutor 29 Paul Keller, Board Administrator 30

Deena Parmelee, Legal Office Administrator 1, Department of State

Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director, Department of State

34 35 36

31 32

33

ALSO PRESENT:

37 38 39

40 41 42

43 44 45

46 47 48

Therapists

49 Boards 50 Stephanie Dunkerley

Natalie Cook, Associate, McNees-Winter Group Twyla Jones, Manager, Online Programs Section, Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection Camille Baughman, MA, BSed, LMT, American Massage Therapy Association Pennsylvania Chapter, Government Relations Edward Portley Jr., LMT, Just This Side of Heaven Massage & Continuing Education for Massage Ashley Hernandez, MPA, Government Relations Specialist, Federation of State Massage Therapy

State Board of Massage Therapy April 2, 2024

ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)

Liliana Fisher, Esquire, CGA Law Firm Jamie Lester, LMT, Owner, Elevated Wellness Derek Richmond, Sargent's Court Reporting Service,

1 ***

State Board of Massage Therapy
April 2, 2024

* * *

[Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, at 9:00 a.m. the Board entered into Executive Session with Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations and to receive advice of counsel on the matters upon which the Board would later vote. The Board returned to open session at 10:30 a.m.]

* * *

The regularly scheduled meeting of the State
Board of Massage Therapy was held on Tuesday, April
2, 2024. Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB,
Chair, called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

* * *

[Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, noted the meeting was being recorded, and those who continued to participate were giving their consent to be recorded.

Mr. Hinsey also noted the Board entered into Executive Session with Board Counsel to have attorney-client consultations and for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial deliberations.]

5 1 Introduction of Board Members/Attendees 2 3 [Chair Porambo requested an introduction of Board 4 members and attendees. A quorum of Board members was 5 present.] * * * 6 7 Approval of minutes of the February 13, 2024 meeting 8 CHAIR PORAMBO: 9 Let's see if we can get the minutes of 10 the meeting approved from February 13, 2024. Are there any changes? Hearing 11 12 none. 13 I'll ask for a motion? 14 MR. HINSEY: 15 At this time, I believe the Board Chair 16 would entertain a motion to approve the draft minutes of the meeting on 17 18 February 13, 2024. 19 CHAIR PORAMBO: 20 Do we have a motion? 21 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT: 22 So moved. 23 MR. STRAWSER: 24 I'll second it. 25 MR. KELLER:

Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye; 1 2 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth, 3 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye; 4 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye. 5

[The motion carried unanimously.]

* * *

7 Regulatory Report

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

[Thomas M. Davis, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel, provided Board members with a Regulatory Report prior to this meeting. He addressed the practice of massage therapy in cosmetology and esthetician salons and virtual supervision. He stated the practice of massage therapy in cosmetology salons was published as proposed in 2023.

Mr. Davis reported receiving two comments from the licensure base and a letter from the Independent Regulatory Review Commission (IRRC) that essentially summarized the two comments received. He mentioned also having the same discussion with the Board of Cosmetology.

Mr. Davis noted one public comment was received on December 21, 2023, stating the requirement of 120 square feet is onerous, because there was only one instance where their office was that size in 42 years. He noted the public comment also mentioned

the vast majority of offices were smaller than 120 square feet, and the size of the separate massage therapy room must provide for the safe and effective application of massage therapy, allowing for freedom of movement.

Mr. Davis stated 120 square feet is the current requirement in the annex of massage therapy in the cosmetology salon regulation.

Mr. Davis noted the second comment stated a 10' x 10' or 10' x 11' room still provides enough room and is 100 square feet or 110 square feet. The comment further stated the Cosmetology Board has allowed owners to file for an exemption, where the Board of Massage Therapy may want to consider a similar exception.

Mr. Davis addressed the letter from IRRC on February 15, 2024, asking the Board to reevaluate with the Cosmetology Board the reasonableness of the appropriate minimum square footage requirement in the final regulation, as well as ways to minimize fiscal impacts from implementation of the final regulation.

Mr. Davis mentioned speaking with Board Counsel after receiving the comments and discussing the possibility of having an exemption or an exception similar to the Cosmetology Board. He reported the

Cosmetology Board has a minimum square footage of 60 square feet per licensee but does have the ability to allow licensees to ask for an exception.

Mr. Hinsey addressed the State Board of
Cosmetology requirements, noting each salon must be
120 square feet for the salon itself but requires 60
square feet of space for each additional licensee.
He explained a massage therapist joining a salon
would only be required to have 60 square feet of
space to practice and having the requirement of 120
square feet for massage therapists in esthetician
salons or cosmetology salons would increase that.

Mr. Hinsey mentioned requiring 120 square feet in places that are already in practice with massage therapists in those salons at a much smaller square footage would require an increase in their square footage and have a negative financial impact. He noted cosmetology provides for a variance request for floor space.

Mr. Hinsey believed reducing the amount of square footage to something more reasonable would be appropriate and to allow for a variance request mainly for places that are still in existence currently and practicing safely.

Mr. Davis informed Board members that he and Mr.

Hinsey discussed lowering the 120 square foot
requirement to 90 square feet. He mentioned
receiving five letters from Massage Envy individuals
when the regulation was sent out for an exposure
draft a few years ago saying that their treatment
rooms are currently set at a minimum of 90 square
feet and suggested lowering it from 120 square feet
to 90 square feet.

Mr. Davis informed Board members that the exception or exemption might get a little difficult to actually do, because they would probably be asking the Cosmetology Board to review the requests for exception because it is an exception to the square footage of the cosmetology salon. He stated cosmetology salons are the ones that are already set up for the exceptions and exemptions, and they would be asking a sister board to review the need or the appropriateness of a smaller room.

Mr. Davis stated the Board may want to just set the square footage to 90, instead of 120, to appease the commenters and IRRC and to appease the five commenters from the exposure draft a few years ago.

Ms. Douglas commented that lowering it from 120 square feet to 90 square feet is absolutely reasonable, noting she worked in a room as small as

an 8' x 10' in size. She mentioned there are many Massage Envy franchises across the United States and making it larger than what they have is would be a big deal. She also mentioned the exceptions would be difficult, because it would go through the Board of Cosmetology, noting they do not have site licenses.

Mr. Hinsey clarified that the variance request for cosmetology salons is already built into their regulations and statutes. If a salon wanted a floor variance request, the Board of Cosmetology would already be reviewing that request. He reported the Board of Cosmetology adheres closely to the requirements set by statutes and regulations and believed they would respect the 90 square feet.

Ms. Hicks agreed with Ms. Douglas, noting many massage therapy rooms may be as little as 8' x 10', so 90 square feet is probably the smallest appropriate size.

Mr. Strawser commented that 90 square feet is big enough for even some storage and believed it to be sufficient, along with the rest of the Board members.

Mr. Davis informed Board members that he would draft the final preamble, which addresses the questions, and amend the annex to a final annex to change it from 120 square feet to 90 square feet. He

would be responding to the comments and putting the
final preamble before the Board as soon as possible,
so the Board could vote on moving forward through the
process.

Mr. Davis addressed the virtual supervision regulation, noting a discussion at the last meeting concerning virtual education and how it would benefit the licensure base, which is why there is a regulation in the works. He referred to Act 100 of 2021, which is now in the law under Title 63 § 3107.1 and § 3102, noting one is the discussion of virtual supervision and one is the discussion of the virtual platform.

Mr. Davis reminded everyone that Act 100 of 2021 passed right after the COVID emergency to formalize and recognize the fact that online education is becoming mainstream when it comes to licensure, and many individuals seeking licensure appreciated the ability for virtual education.

Mr. Davis mentioned the Board's statute requires individuals to obtain 600 hours in class, and current regulations define in class as in the physical presence of an instructor. He noted the regulations would need to be amended to allow for virtual supervision or virtual education on a long-term

basis.

Mr. Davis mentioned the Board would be essentially doing the same as it did during the emergency, which is allowing up to 125 of the 600 hours to be obtained via virtual supervision. He informed Board members that he was still working on the regulation and simultaneously working on the cosmetology regulation.

Ms. Hicks thanked Mr. Davis and commented that it would be very helpful for educational purposes and schools for adoption.

Ashley Hernandez, MPA, Government Relations
Specialist, Federation of State Massage Therapy
Boards, asked whether the Board had an outline of
which classes would be permitted via virtual and
which classed would be required to be in person.

Mr. Davis explained that the Board's regulations outline how many hours must be obtained in different facets of the education, and the Board was discussing allowing a certain percentage of those hours to be virtual. He referred to the annex portion circulated in 2022 of the Board's current regulations under \$ 20.11, minimum hour requirements for massage therapy programs. He noted the requirement of at least 175 contact hours of instruction in anatomy, physiology,

kinesiology, and pathology, including a few other
topics. He explained the Board was considering
allowing 75 of those 175 hours to be obtained through
contact hours, where 100 of the 175 could be obtained
via virtual education.

- Mr. Davis referred to § 20.11 (a) (2), where at least 250 contact hours in massage therapy and bodywork assessment must be earned through contact hours, noting no change there. He referred to § 20.11 (a) (3), at least 25 hours in professional ethics and business law related to massage therapy business, where all 25 of those would be allowed through virtual education. He also referred to § 20.11 (a) (4), at least 150 hours in related courses, all of which must be earned through contact hours.
- Mr. Davis explained that it would be 100 hours in § 20.11(a)(1) and 25 hours in § 20.11(a)(3). He offered to provide the draft version of the annex and the exposure draft to anyone who wished to make comments.
- 21 Ms. Hicks asked Mr. Davis to provide a timeframe 22 for schools.
- 23 Mr. Davis suggested the proposed regulation be 24 published sometime late summer of 2024, which would 25 allow for a 30-day public comment period. He noted

1 | the Board would review the comments, receive comments

- 2 from several different sources, and then draft the
- 3 | final regulation. He explained that it may be months
- 4 to a full year before the regulation is published as
- 5 final.]
- 6 ***
- 7 Report of Board Counsel
- 8 | Final Adjudications and Orders
- 9 MR. HINSEY:
- 10 Based on Executive Session
- deliberations, I believe the Board
- 12 Chair would entertain a motion to
- direct Board Counsel to issue the Final
- 14 Adjudication and Order in the matter of
- agenda item 6, Tamer Ahmed, Case No.
- 16 22-72-005932.
- 17 CHAIR PORAMBO:
- Do I have a motion?
- 19 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:
- 20 So moved.
- 21 MR. STRAWSER:
- 22 I'll second the motion.
- 23 MR. KELLER:
- Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
- Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, recuse; Keth,

15 1 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye; 2 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye. 3 [The motion carried. Jessica Nelson recused herself 4 from deliberations and voting on the motion.] 5 MR. HINSEY: 6 7 Based on Executive Session deliberations, I believe the Board 8 9 Chair would entertain a motion to direct Board Counsel to issue the Final 10 Adjudication and Order in the matter of 11 12 agenda item 7, Shanshan Cao, Case No. 13 23-72-002253. 14 CHAIR PORAMBO: 15 Do I have a motion? 16 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT: So moved. 17 18 MR. STRAWSER: I'll second the motion. 19 20 MR. KELLER: 21 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye; 22 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth, 23 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye; 24 Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye. 25 [The motion carried unanimously.]

*

Report of Board Counsel - United States Department of Education Title Funding [Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, stated the new eligibility rules for the United States Department of Education Title IV of the Higher Education Act funds will go into effect July 1, 2024. He explained that the changes may impact new students who enroll in educational programs that exceed the minimum number of hours required by statute and/or the Board's regulations to obtain licensure by the Board.

Mr. Hinsey noted that schools offering educational programs to prepare students for gainful employment in a recognized occupation, including those regulated by the Board, would be required to provide specific information to the Department of Education about the educational program and the Board's requirements for licensure.

Mr. Hinsey commented that the Board is unable to provide specific or general legal advice regarding the new rules to potential students or institutions offering the programs. He encouraged potential students to visit the Department of Education's website at www.ed.gov and speak with their school or educational institution for additional information on

```
the affect of the new rules to their educational
goals and ability to qualify for Title IV of the
Higher Education Act funds.

Mr. Hinsey also noted that educational
institutions are encouraged to visit the Department
```

institutions are encouraged to visit the Department of Education website in conjunction with their legal counsel for information specific to the institution and its educational programs. He offered to place links for the final regulations and fact sheets on the final rule into the group chat.]

11

12 Report of Board Prosecutors - No Report

13

14 Report of Acting Commissioner - No Report

15

16 Report of Board Administrator

17 | Applications

18 MR. HINSEY:

19 Based on Executive Session

deliberations, I believe the Board

21 Chair would entertain a motion at

agenda item 8 to provisionally deny the

Application for Licensure as a Massage

24 Therapist of Nancy Tieu.

25 CHAIR PORAMBO:

```
18
                  Do I have a motion?
1
2
   ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:
3
                  So moved.
4
   MR. STRAWSER:
5
                  I'll second.
6
   MR. KELLER:
                  Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye;
8
                  Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth,
9
                  aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye;
10
                  Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye.
11
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
12
13
   Report of Board Administrator
14
   Waiver Request
15
   MR. HINSEY:
16
                  Based on Executive Session
                  deliberations, I believe the Board
17
18
                  Chair would entertain a motion at
19
                  agenda item 9 to grant the Waiver
20
                  Request of Jamie Nester.
21
   CHAIR PORAMBO:
22
                  Do I have a motion?
23
   ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:
24
                  So moved.
25
   MR. STRAWSER:
```

I'll second it. 1 2 MR. KELLER: 3 Porambo, aye; Claggett, aye; 4 Chamberlain, aye; Nelson, aye; Keth, 5 aye; Strawser, aye; Douglas, aye; Hicks, aye; Alumbro Shade, aye. 6 7 [The motion carried unanimously.] 8 9 Miscellaneous - Sunshine Act Presentation 10 [Jared Hinsey, Esquire, Board Counsel, provided a 11 Pennsylvania Sunshine Act presentation to discuss its 12 effect on the Board's operations. He stated it is 13 the right of the public to be present at all meetings 14 of agencies and to witness the deliberations, 15 decision-making, and policy formulation, which is 16 vital to the enhancement and proper functioning of 17 the democratic process. 18 Mr. Hinsey stated meetings must be open to the 19 public after public notice when deliberations or 20 official actions will take place. He provided the 21 definition of agency, deliberation, and official 22 action. 23 Mr. Hinsey addressed public notice, where an 24 agency is required to give public notice on its first

regular meeting of each calendar year, not less than

- 1 three days in advance of the meeting and shall give
- 2 public notice of the schedule of its remaining
- 3 | meetings. He noted the agency shall give public
- 4 | notice of any special meetings 24 hours in advance.
- 5 He stated public notice is not required in the case
- 6 of an emergency meeting or conference.
- 7 Mr. Hinsey explained that public notice includes
- B the publication of notice of the place, date, and
- 9 time of the meeting in a newspaper of general
- 10 circulation, posting a notice at the office of the
- 11 agency holding the meeting, and at the public
- 12 building in which the meeting is held. He mentioned
- 13 Act 65 of 2021 also added posting the agenda on a
- 14 publicly accessible website and listing each matter
- 15 of agency business.
- 16 Mr. Hinsey addressed the recording of votes,
- 17 where the vote of each member must be publicly casted
- 18 and recorded, noting one must be seen as well as
- 19 heard.
- 20 Mr. Hinsey stated written minutes must be kept of
- 21 all meetings and made available to the public. He
- 22 noted the only exceptions for the open meeting
- 23 requirements are for conferences and executive
- 24 sessions. He mentioned conferences, training
- 25 programs, and seminars are organized for the purpose

of providing information to members directly related to their official responsibilities. He noted deliberation of agency business may not occur at a conference.

Mr. Hinsey stated an executive session may be held for personnel issues, consulting with attorneys or other advisors regarding information in connection with litigation. He mentioned executive sessions could be held at any time during the open meeting. He also noted executive sessions may not be used as subterfuge to defeat the purpose of the act.

Mr. Hinsey addressed legal challenge, noting they must be filed within 30 days from the date of the meeting or within 30 days from the discovery of an action that occurred at a meeting that was not open and Sunshine Act was violated. He stated no action may be commenced more than a year from the date of the meeting on which the alleged violation occurred.

Mr. Hinsey addressed penalties for a violation. He stated the key points are that Board business, deliberations, and official action must be conducted in open meetings. He noted Board members should not discuss agency business, especially Executive Session matters, outside of an official Board meeting.

Mr. Hinsey stated committee meetings also have to

- take place in an open meeting if it is for
 formulating policy or regulations, noting
 administrative or prosecutorial functions do not have
 to occur at an open meeting.
 - Mr. Hinsey addressed recusal guidelines, noting recusal is mandatory when a Board member has a prosecutorial role in the matter or direct personal financial interest in the outcome of the matter.

- Mr. Hinsey noted it is strongly suggested to recuse if a Board member has knowledge from outside of a case that they cannot set aside in order to make a fair and unbiased determination.
- Mr. Hinsey addressed discretionary recusal, where a Board members should recuse themselves if they cannot decide on a subject fairly without prejudice. He encouraged Board members to contact Board Counsel in advance if they are uncertain whether to recuse.
- Mr. Hinsey addressed the difference between abstention and recusal, where abstention is withholding a vote and does not affect quorum requirements, but recusal is when someone is unable vote and will have an effect on the quorum.
- Mr. Hinsey addressed conflicts of interest, where no member of any professional examining and licensing board shall at the same time be an officer or agent

of any statewide association or organization representing the profession or occupation subject to the Board's actions.

Mr. Hinsey addressed additional conflicts of interest for public board members, where a member of a licensing board or commission designated as representing the public at large shall be a private citizen and not be a member of any professional occupation which is regulated or licensed by the board, commission, or Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs nor be related to or part of the immediate family of any member of the profession or occupation to be licensed or regulated by the particular board or commission.

Mr. Hinsey stated public Board members also may not be affiliated in any way with the profession or occupation to be licensed or regulated. He noted they may also not hold any other appointed or elective public office or position within the Commonwealth or another state or the United States government during the appointed term for which they serve. He mentioned any person not meeting the standards set forth herein shall be ineligible for membership on the board or commission as a public member.

* * *

2 | Next Meeting Date

1

- 3 | [Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair, noted
- 4 | the next scheduled Board meeting date is June 4,
- 5 2024. She also noted the remaining 2024 meeting
- 6 dates are August 13, September 24, and December 3.]
- 7 | ***
- 8 Report of Board Chair
- 9 | [Nancy M. Porambo, MS, LMT, CNMT, NCTMB, Chair,
- 10 thanked everyone for their participation and interest
- 11 | in this meeting.
- 12 Chair Porambo announced Vickiann Hicks would be
- 13 | leaving the Board and thanked her for her service to
- 14 | the State Board of Massage Therapy.]
- 15 ***
- 16 Adjournment
- 17 CHAIR PORAMBO:
- I'd like to make a motion to adjourn.
- 19 ACTING COMMISSIONER CLAGGETT:
- So moved.
- 21 MR. STRAWSER:
- 22 Second.
- 23 CHAIR PORAMBO:

- Thank you everyone.
 - * * *

[There being no further business, the State Board of Massage Therapy Meeting adjourned at 11:11 a.m.] * * * CERTIFICATE I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Board of Massage Therapy Meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Board of Massage Therapy Meeting. Derek Richmond, Minute Clerk Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.