State Real Estate Commission August 20, 2024

3 4 5

1

2

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

6 7 8

9

10

11

12 13 14

15

16

Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Chair, Public Member Kyle Sampson, Vice Chair, Public Member

Annie Hanna Cestra, Secretary, Industry Member Joseph Tarantino, Industry Member

Jeffrey J. Johnson, Industry Member Anne M. Rubin, Industry Member - Absent

Guy Saxton, Cemetery Member

Jennifer Thomson, Esquire, Attorney General designee Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs

17 18 19

COMMISSION PERSONNEL:

20 21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39 40

41

42

Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel Jason Giurintano, Deputy Chief Counsel, Counsel Division, Department of State

Ray J. Michalowski, Esquire, Senior Commission Prosecutor

Carlton Smith, Deputy Chief Counsel, Prosecution Division

Nathan C. Giunta, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor

Tyesha C. Miley, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor Ashley P. Murphy, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor

Angela L. Solomon, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor

Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor

Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator Laura Thompson, Clerical Assistant 2

Marc Farrell, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel,

Office of Chief Counsel, Department of State

Andrew LaFratte, MPA, Deputy Policy Director, Department of State

Richard E. Morrissette, Deputy Director, Bureau of Enforcement and Investigation, Department of State Jessica Zukoski, Senior Legal Analyst, Department of State

43 44 45

ALSO PRESENT:

46 47 48

Francesca Tracy, Compliance Analyst, The CE Shop Janis Benstock, Janis Benstock Real Estate Academy

State Real Estate Commission August 20, 2024

ALSO PRESENT: (cont.)

Della Csehoski, Cambria Somerset Association of Realtors

Tracy Matroni, Education & Member Services at Lancaster County Association of Realtors/Keystone Chapter of the Appraisal Institute

Anne-Marie Click, Brunswick County Association of Realtors

Lisa Ginsburg, Director of Education, Bucks County Real Estate Institute

Nicole Murray, RCE, Association Executive, Pocono Mountains Association of Realtors

Lisa Aaron, Professional Standards & Education Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors Michael McGee, CAE, RCE, Chief Executive Officer, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors

Lauren Gusherowski, Sargent's Court Reporting Service, Inc.

1

2 State Real Estate Commission

August 20, 2024

* * *

5 [Pursuant to Section 708(a)(5) of the Sunshine Act, 6 at 9:00 a.m. the Commission entered into Executive

7 | Session with Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission

8 Counsel, for the purpose of conducting quasi-judicial

9 deliberations on matters currently pending before the

10 Commission that are listed on the agenda. The

11 Commission returned to open session at 11:00 a.m.]

12 **

The regularly scheduled meeting of the State Real

Estate Commission was held on Tuesday, August 20,

15 2024. Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Chair, Public

16 Member, officially called the meeting to order at

17 | 11:01 a.m.

3

4

18

19 [Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,

20 informed everyone that the meeting was being

21 recorded, and voluntary participation constituted

22 | consent to be recorded.

23 Mr. Picarella also noted the Commission entered

24 into Executive Session for the purpose of conducting

25 quasi-judicial deliberations on a number of matters

```
5
   currently pending before the Commission and to
1
2
   receive the advice of counsel.
3
   Roll Call
4
   [Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Chair, Public
5
6
   Member, requested a roll call of Commission members.
7
   A quorum was present.]
8
                              * * *
9
   Introduction of Attendees
10
   [Deon Bowers, Commission Administrator, provided an
   introduction of attendees.
11
12
        Jason Giurintano, Deputy Chief Counsel, Counsel
13
   Division, Department of State, introduced himself and
14
   provided a brief summary of his professional
15
   background.]
                              * * *
16
   Pledge of Allegiance
17
18
   [The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.]
                              * * *
19
20
   Approval of minutes of the July 10, 2024 meeting
21
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
22
                  We'll turn to the draft minutes from
23
                  the July 10, 2024 meeting.
24
                       Is there a motion to approve those
25
                  minutes?
```

6 1 MR. TARANTINO: 2 So moved. 3 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 4 Is there a second? 5 MR. SAMPSON: Second. 6 7 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 8 Any discussion on the motion? Ms. 9 Bowers, do the roll call, please. 10 11 Gaetano Piccirilli, abstain; Kyle 12 Sampson, aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; 13 Joseph Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, 14 aye; Guy Saxton, abstain; Jennifer 15 Thomson, aye; Arion Claggett, aye. 16 [The motion carried. Gaetano Piccirilli and Guy 17 Saxton abstained from voting on the motion.] * * * 18 19 Report of Prosecutorial Division 20 [Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor, 21 on behalf of Timothy A. Fritsch, presented the Consent Agreement for Case Nos. 21-56-016591 & 21-56-22 23 016600.1 24 25 [Caroline A. Bailey, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor,

presented the Consent Agreement for Case Nos. 23-56-1 012183 & 24-56-002667.1 2 3 4 [Nathan C. Giunta, Esquire, Commission Prosecutor, 5 presented the Consent Agreement for Case No. 22-56-001290.1 6 7 MR. PICARELLA: 8 After hearing the report of 9 prosecution, does any member of the 10 Commission wish to go back into Executive Session for any reason. 11 12 Hearing none. 13 Based upon discussions in Executive 14 Session, I believe the Commission Chair 15 would entertain a motion to approve the 16 Consent Agreements at item 2 on the agenda, Case Nos. 21-56-016591 & 21-56-17 18 016600; item 3 on the agenda, Case No. 19 22-56-001290; and item 4 on the agenda, 20 Case Nos. 23-56-012183 & 24-56-002667. 21 Do we have the motion? 22 MR. TARANTINO: 23 So moved. 24 MR. SAMPSON: 25 Second.

8 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 1 2 Roll call. 3 Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, 4 5 aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph 6 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; 7 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye; 8 Arion Claggett, aye. 9 [The motion carried unanimously. The Respondents' names at item 2, Case Nos. 21-56-016591 & 21-56-10 11 016600, are Sarah Hall & SHall, LLC d/b/a/ Stiletto 12 Property Management; item 3, Case No. 22-56-001290, 13 Fred Glick; and item 4, Case Nos. 23-56-012183 & 24-14 56-002667, Bedford Olde Towne Realty LLC & F. 15 Bradford Adams.] 16 17 Report of Commission Counsel - Proposed Adjudication 18 and Order MR. PICARELLA: 19 20 Item 5 on the agenda is a Proposed 21 Adjudication and Order in the matter of 22 Nicole Huber & Mitchell K. Ross, Case 23 Nos. 22-56-012975 & 22-56-016656. 24 Based upon discussions in Executive 25 Session, I believe the Chair would

```
9
                  entertain a motion to adopt the hearing
1
2
                  examiner's Proposed Adjudication and
3
                  Order in this matter and direct counsel
                  to prepare the Commission's Final
 4
5
                  Order.
6
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
7
                  Is there such a motion?
8
   MR. TARANTINO:
9
                  So moved.
10
   MR. SAMPSON:
11
                  Second.
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
12
13
                  Roll call vote.
14
15
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
16
                  Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;
17
18
                  Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;
19
                  Arion Claggett, aye.
20
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
21
                               * * *
22
   Report of Commission Counsel - Final Adjudications
23
     and Orders
   MR. PICARELLA:
24
25
                  Item 6 on the agenda is the Final
```

```
10
                  Adjudication and Order in the matter of
1
                  Branly D. Morel aka Brandly Morel, Case
2
3
                  No. 23-56-001671.
 4
                       Based upon discussions in Executive
 5
                  Session, I believe the Commission Chair
                  would entertain a motion to approve the
 6
7
                  Final Adjudication and Order in this
                  matter and direct counsel to issue it
9
                  as the Final Order of the Commission.
10
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
11
                  Is there such a motion?
   MR. TARANTINO:
12
13
                  So moved.
14
   MR. SAMPSON:
15
                  Second.
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
16
                  Roll call.
17
18
19
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
20
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
21
                  Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;
22
                  Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;
23
                  Arion Claggett, aye.
24
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
25
```

11 MR. PICARELLA: 1 Item 7 on the agenda is Paul A. James, 2 3 Case No. 21-56-017516. Based upon discussions in Executive 4 5 Session, I believe the Commission Chair 6 would entertain a motion to approve the 7 Final Adjudication and Order in this matter and direct counsel to issue it 9 as the Final Order of the Commission. 10 MR. TARANTINO: 11 So moved. CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 12 13 Is there a second? 14 MR. SAMPSON: 15 Second. CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 16 Roll call vote. 17 18 19 Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, 20 aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph 21 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; 22 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye; 23 Arion Claggett, aye. 24 [The motion carried unanimously.] 25

12 MR. PICARELLA: 1 2 Item 8 on the agenda is Alexander 3 Brunelle, Case No. 24-56-008935. 4 Based upon discussions in Executive 5 Session, I believe the Chair would 6 entertain a motion to approve the Final Adjudication and Order in this matter and direct counsel to issue it as the 9 Final Order of the Commission. 10 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 11 Is there a motion? MR. TARANTINO: 12 13 So moved. 14 MR. SAMPSON: 15 Second. CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 16 Roll call vote. 17 18 Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, 19 20 aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph 21 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; 22 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye; 23 Arion Claggett, aye. 24 [The motion carried unanimously.] 25

```
13
   Report of Commission Counsel - Motion
1
2
   MR. PICARELLA:
3
                  Item 9 on the agenda is Saleem Boyd
 4
                  Purefoey, Case No. 23-56-014700.
 5
                       Based upon discussions in Executive
                  Session, I believe the Commission Chair
 6
 7
                  would entertain a motion to grant the
                  Commonwealth's Motion to Deem Facts
8
9
                  Admitted and direct Commission counsel
10
                  to draft the Final Adjudication and
                  Order in accordance with discussions in
11
                  Executive Session.
12
13
   MR. TARANTINO:
14
                  So moved.
15
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
16
                  Second?
17
   MR. JOHNSON:
18
                  Second.
19
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
20
                  Let's do a roll call vote.
21
22
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
23
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
24
                  Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;
                  Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;
25
```

1 Arion Claggett, aye.

2 [The motion carried unanimously.]

3 | ***

4 Report of Commission Counsel - Regulatory Report

5 | [Marc Farrell, Esquire, Regulatory Counsel, Office of

6 | Chief Counsel, Department of State, referred to 16A-

7 | 5616 regarding the general revisions package and

B asked whether Commission members had any feedback on

9 the annex.

Mr. Picarella asked whether the Commission wanted
to schedule a meeting with their Regulatory Committee

12 for a review of the annex, and Commission members

13 agreed. He informed Mr. Farrell that the Commission

14 would look into setting up a separate meeting and

15 getting that sunshined.

Mr. Farrell noted that the 46-page annex would be distributed to Commission members if it had not been provided.]

19 ***

20 Report of Commission Counsel - Other

21 | [Dean F. Picarella, Esquire, Commission Counsel,

22 | noted the Commission tabled item 10 on the agenda,

23 | Marilyn Melasecca, Case No. 23-56-012836, to allow

24 counsel to get additional information from the

25 respondent.

1 2 Report of Commission Chairperson 3 [Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Chair, Public 4 Member, thanked everyone, particularly Mr. Sampson 5 for chairing the last meeting or two. He noted looking forward to seeing each other at Temple 6 7 University Center City in Philadelphia.] 8 9 Report of Acting Commissioner 10 [Arion R. Claggett, Acting Commissioner, Bureau of Professional and Occupational Affairs, informed 11 Commission members that all of the board websites 12 13 were recently updated and encouraged everyone to 14 check out their new website.] 15 16 Report of Commission Administrator - No Report 17 18 Report of Committees - Education/Examination 19 Committee 20 MR. PICARELLA: 21 Item 11 on the agenda is the 22

Item 11 on the agenda is the Application for the continuing education course called Fair Housing for Agents and Brokers.

Based upon discussions in Executive

23

24

```
Session, I believe the Commission Chair
1
2
                  would entertain a motion to approve the
3
                  Application for approval of real estate
 4
                  education provider and instructor
 5
                  course of Janis Benstock Real Estate
 6
                  Academy, entitled Fair Housing for
7
                  Agents and Brokers.
8
   MS. CESTRA:
9
                  So moved.
10
   MR. JOHNSON:
11
                  Second.
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
12
13
                  Roll call.
14
15
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
16
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
17
                  Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;
18
                  Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;
19
                  Arion Claggett, aye.
20
   [The motion carried unanimously.]
                               * * *
21
22
   MR. PICARELLA:
23
                  Item 12 on the agenda is the CE Course
24
                  Upholding Fair Housing Laws.
25
                       Based upon discussion in Executive
```

17 Session, I believe the Commission Chair 1 2 would entertain a motion to approve the 3 Application for approval of The CE Shop's Application for approval as a 4 5 real estate education provider for the 6 distance education course Upholding 7 Fair Housing Laws. 8 MS. CESTRA: 9 So moved. 10 MR. JOHNSON: 11 Second. CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 12 13 Roll call vote, please. 14 15 Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, 16 aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph 17 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; 18 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye; 19 Arion Claggett, aye. 20 [The motion carried unanimously.] * * * 21 22 MR. PICARELLA: 23 Item 13 on the agenda is the CE Course 24 on Fair Housing Refresher. 25 Based upon discussion in Executive

18 Session, I believe the Commission Chair 1 2 would entertain a motion to approve the 3 Application for approval of real estate education provider, instructor, and 4 5 course of Polley Associates, entitled 6 Fair Housing Refresher. 7 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: Is there a motion? 8 9 MS. CESTRA: 10 So moved. MR. JOHNSON: 11 Second. 12 13 CHAIR PICCIRILLI: 14 Roll call vote, please. 15 16 Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, 17 aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph 18 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; 19 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye; 20 Arion Claggett, aye.

21 [The motion carried unanimously.]

22

23 MR. PICARELLA:

Item 14 on the agenda is the Broker
Examination of Eric Joseph Hopkins.

```
I believe, based upon discussions
1
                  in Executive Session, the Commission
2
3
                  Chair would entertain a motion to
 4
                  approve the Application of Eric Joseph
 5
                  Hopkins to Sit for the Broker Sole-
 6
                  Proprietorship Licensure by
7
                  Examination.
8
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
9
                  Is there a motion?
10
   MS. CESTRA:
11
                  So moved.
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
12
13
                  Is there a second?
14
   MR. SAXTON:
15
                  Second.
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
16
                  Roll call vote.
17
18
19
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
20
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
21
                  Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;
22
                  Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;
23
                  Arion Claggett, aye.
24
    [The motion carried unanimously.]
25
```

```
20
   Report of Committees - Enforcement Committee -
1
2
     Application Review
3
   MR. PICARELLA:
 4
                  The first one is the Application Review
 5
                  of Philip Correa at item 15 on the
 6
                  agenda.
7
                       Based upon discussions in Executive
                  Session, I believe the Commission Chair
9
                  would entertain a motion to
10
                  provisionally deny the Application of
11
                  Philip Correa for licensure as a
                  timeshare salesperson and direct
12
13
                  Commission counsel to draft
14
                  correspondence to the Applicant in
15
                  accordance with discussions in
                  Executive Session.
16
17
   MR. TARANTINO:
18
                  So moved.
19
   MR. SAMPSON:
20
                  Second.
21
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
22
                  Roll call vote, please.
23
24
                  Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson,
25
                  aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph
```

2.1

1 Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye;

2 Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;

3 Arion Claggett, nay.

4 [The motion carried. Arion Claggett opposed the

5 motion.]

6 ***

7 Report of Committees - Enforcement Committee -

8 Informal Conferences

9 MR. PICARELLA:

10 Item 16 on the agenda is the Informal

11 Conference of Chase Witten.

Based upon discussions in Executive

13 | Session, I believe the Commission Chair

14 would entertain a motion to

provisionally deny the Application of

Chase Witten to Sit for the Real Estate

17 | Salesperson Examination and direct

18 counsel to draft a letter to the

19 Applicant in accordance with

20 discussions in Executive Session.

21 MR. TARANTINO:

16

22 So moved.

23 MR. SAMPSON:

24 Second.

25 CHAIR PICCIRILLI:

Roll call vote.

2

3

4

5

1

Gaetano Piccirilli, aye; Kyle Sampson, aye; Annie Hanna Cestra, aye; Joseph Tarantino, aye; Jeffrey Johnson, aye; Guy Saxton, aye; Jennifer Thomson, aye;

6 7

[The motion carried. Arion Claggett opposed the

9

8

* * *

11 Public Comment

motion. 1

12 [Michael McGee, CAE, Chief Executive Officer,

13 Pennsylvania Association of Realtors, informed

14 Commission members that the Pennsylvania Association

Arion Claggett, nay.

15 of Realtors (PAR) has received several calls from

16 members who are requesting continuing education

17 transcripts. He stated a staff member reached out to

18 the Commission and learned that the annual audit had

19 not yet started.

Mr. McGee requested the Commission provide PAR

21 with an overview of the audit plans and when to

22 expect the audit to begin so that the information

23 | could be communicated to their local associations and

24 members.

25 Mr. McGee thanked Acting Commissioner Claggett

for the fast response in providing the renewal information he requested at the last meeting.

Mr. McGee addressed updates concerning changes in the industry. He referred to prior discussion regarding the National Association of Realtors settlement agreement and practice changes that needed to be in place by August 17, 2024. He reported the primary settlement changes, including offers of compensation are prohibited on the multiple listing service (MLS) and agents working with the buyer must enter into a written agreement before touring a home.

Mr. McGee believed there may be some consumers who will reach out to the Commission and/or PAR with questions about signing an agreement with an agent before touring a home because they may not be accustomed to the change. He mentioned that PAR has hosted several webinars for both brokers and agents explaining the updates made to their standard forms reflecting the changes to help prepare their members.

Mr. McGee stated PAR also partnered with 18 of their local associations to launch a consumer outreach campaign to educate consumers about changes they will find if they are entering the home-buying market. He noted the importance of ensuring that both their members and consumers understand the

changes affecting the industry.

Lisa Aaron, Professional Standards & Education
Manager, Pennsylvania Association of Realtors, stated
all of the courses approved on the agenda fall under
the new required topic in the next CE cycle for fair
housing. She asked whether all of the courses under
the required topic in the next cycle that ends in
2026 for fair housing and agency representation need
to go before the education committee for approval or
are they going to be taken on a one-by-one basis.

Ms. Aaron also asked, if courses were submitted prior to last month's final decision by the Real Estate Education Committee to make those topics required, can courses that were submitted under fair housing and agency representation be grandfathered or do they need to be resubmitted to meet the required topic because they would normally be marked as elective on the application.

Ms. Cestra explained that the application has a particular area that is checked off if it is something that is required CE, so they would have to resubmit those to be considered for the mandatory requirement. She also noted that all of the applications for CE under the mandatory requirement will not be coming to the Commission for a vote. She

```
25
   mentioned that the staff wanted to be sure they were
1
2
   on the right track with just the first few.
3
        Acting Commissioner Claggett noted the need to
4
   look into resubmission further. He stated there will
5
   be an update regarding CE audits at the next meeting
6
   as well.]
7
                              * * *
8
   Miscellaneous
   [Gaetano P. Piccirilli, Esquire, Chair, Public
10
   Member, noted that the next State Real Estate
   Commission Meeting will be held on October 1 in
11
12
   Philadelphia, followed by November 20 in Harrisburg.]
13
                              * * *
14
   Adjournment
15
   CHAIR PICCIRILLI:
16
                  Is there a motion to adjourn the
17
                  meeting?
18
   MR. TARANTINO:
19
                  So moved.
                              * * *
20
21
   [There being no further business, the State Real
22
   Estate Commission Meeting adjourned at 11:40 a.m.]
23
24
25
26
```

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that the foregoing summary minutes of the State Real Estate Commission meeting, was reduced to writing by me or under my supervision, and that the minutes accurately summarize the substance of the State Real Estate Commission meeting.

Lauren Gusherowski,

Minute Clerk

Sargent's Court Reporting
Service, Inc.

			27
123456789011234156789012322222222333333333333333333333333333		STATE REAL ESTATE COMMISSION REFERENCE INDEX	
		August 20, 2024	
	TIME	AGENDA	
	9:00 11:00	Executive Session Return to Open Session	
	11:01	Official Call to Order	
	11:02	Roll Call	
	11:02	Introduction of Attendees	
	11:04	Pledge of Allegiance	
	11:05	Approval of Minutes	
	11:06	Report of Prosecutorial Division	
	11:15	Report of Commission Counsel	
	11:27	Report of Commission Chair	
	11:27	Report of Acting Commissioner	
	11:28	Report of Committees	
	11:35	Public Comment	
	11:39	Miscellaneous	
	11:40	Adjournment	
38 39			
40 41			
42			
44 45			
46 47			
48 49			
50			