

Writing T-Chart – Proposition/Support Outline

CIP 47.0604 Automobile/Automotive Mechanics Technology/Technician

Produce arguments that have a clear thesis statement and support.

Program Task:	PA Core Standard: CC.3.6.11-12.A
644: Identify traction control/vehicle stability control system components.	Description: Write arguments focused on discipline-specific content.

Program Associated Vocabulary:	Writing Associated Vocabulary:
Vehicle stability control (VSC) Traction control Roll sensors Autopilot	Arguments Proposition Support Thesis Statement Inference Logic

Program Strategy:	Literacy Strategy:
<p>Use the proposition/support outline strategy to prepare students to write thesis statements for argumentation pieces.</p> <p>After introducing the proposition/support outline strategy and before starting the project, present the following prompt to the students.</p> <p><i>The Board of Directors at Tesla is questioning the CEO, Elon Musk, about the direction the company is going. Is autopilot a bad idea? The company has made great progress with Level 2 automation with at least two primary control functions designed to work in union to relieve the drive of control of these functions, such as enabling a level 2 system of adaptive cruise control in combination with lane centering.</i></p> <p><i>Research this option Tesla is proposing and develop a proposal to Mr. Musk on whether the company should pursue the autopilot feature. Could this feature really work? What is the supporting evidence?</i></p>	<p>The proposition/support outline provides a graphic organizer by which students identify the "propositions"—statements than can be argued as true, false or debatable—of a document. It can be used as a reading strategy for students to identify evidence for the author’s propositions and used as a pre-writing organizer for students to develop their thesis statements and the evidence they will use to support their propositions.</p> <p><i>Whole Group Instruction</i> Introduce the exercise by reminding students of the differences in fact (provable) and opinion (belief or judgment).</p> <p>Provide students with a list of statements for them to classify as facts, opinions, examples or inferences. Provide enough examples until you are sure that students can identify and explain the differences.</p> <p>Display a short paragraph for students and model locating the thesis statement and types of evidence supporting it.</p>

Program Strategy:	Literacy Strategy:
<p>Recommended articles: “Is Autopilot a Bad Idea?” (Slate) “Why Tesla CEO Elon Musk Is Among the World’s Greatest Leaders” (Fortune)</p> <p>Remind students that they are developing a proposal that they must be able to defend. What proposition do they need to make?</p> <p>Share the opening paragraph of business proposals. Work with students to identify the proposition/thesis statement and any evidence that is identified in the opening paragraph.</p> <p>Have students compose a thesis statement for the Tesla proposal after they have conducted their research. Based on their research, have them generate a list of possible support items for their thesis. Have them categorize each item (e.g., opinion, fact, example, inference). Remind them that they should have a variety of types of relevant support.</p> <p>When the first draft is finished, have students conduct peer reviews on the proposals to give feedback on the supporting evidence cited. Are they facts, opinions, inferences? Do they need additional research to support their recommendations?</p>	<p>Using the current project, have students generate propositions/statements that they could defend.</p> <p><i>Guided Practice</i> Lead students in a discussion of what they learned in the most recent project that the class completed. Ask them to work in their teams to develop a proposition related to their findings. Use the proposition/support outline for them to identify different types of evidence they collected to support that proposition. Teams should have similar propositions and evidence if they completed the same project. Have teams share and discuss any differences.</p> <p><i>Application</i> Share and discuss the scenario for the current project. Have project teams develop their propositions and begin identifying evidence to complete the proposition/support outline. Remind them that if they have additional research and experimentation to complete, they may change their position or identify different evidence. Students should use the organizer to develop their thesis statement and outline before writing the argumentative final paper.</p> <p>In debriefing, use the following questions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How can you identify the different types of evidence? • What are the characteristics of a good thesis statement? • Why is it important to develop a strong thesis statement for an argumentative paper? <p>Listen for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding the role of different types of evidence. • Understanding the importance of a good thesis statement to guide writing. • A thesis statement without support is simply an opinion.

Instructor’s Script – Proposition/Support Outline

It is always important that students consider their evidence before constructing an argumentative paper. A business proposal is an argument: my solution is better than any other for your problem.

Propositions should be clearly stated and backed clearly by evidence. There are different types of acceptable evidence, but personal opinion is not one of them.

Common Mistakes Made by Students

Students frequently believe that their experiences are the best evidence to support their opinions or arguments. They need to understand that evidence to support a position/proposition needs to address what will be most effective to their reader, rather than just what they consider important.

Students also can be confused about the types of evidence. They need to consider the credibility of authorities, for instance, and whether their reasoning is logical.

CTE Instructor's Extended Discussion

Experimentation and hands-on research are critical kinds of evidence to be used for business proposals. However, students need excellent documentation for citing their experiences as evidence and it should be, whenever possible, triangulated with evidence from expert authorities.

Sample Questions

Career and Technical Concepts

Question	Answer
A business proposal is an argumentative paper because it A. Presents a proposition and evidence. B. Is written for an audience. C. Expresses the writer's opinions. D. Contains only facts.	A. Presents a proposition and evidence

PA Core Reading Concepts

Question	Answer
A writer has developed the following thesis statement: The quality of fast food is a function of food retailers, manufacturers, suppliers and restaurant employees. Which of the following would be the best evidence to support that thesis? A. I eat a lot of fast food. B. USA Today has reported that the cost of fast food is rising rapidly. C. Fast food is not good for teens, according to Dr. James Jones. D. A recent study of Hamburger Haven showed that there were 14 different companies and individuals who contributed to each hamburger sold.	D. A recent study of Hamburger Haven showed that there were 14 different companies and individuals who contributed to each hamburger sold.

Proposition/Support Outline

Proposition
Thesis Statement
Facts
Inferences
Examples
Expert Authority
Logic and Reasoning