

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

GOVERNOR'S OFFICE

PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

NOV 27 1973

10-29-73  
11-1-73

GRACE E. MARTIN :  
Complainant :

vs :

IBRAHEEN GHAFOOR :  
Respondent :

Docket No. E-4563

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS  
OF LAW, COMMISSION'S DECISION  
AND FINAL ORDER

---

1. Complainant herein is Grace E. Martin, who resides at 7122 Hermitage Street, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15208.

2. Respondent herein is Ibraheem Ghafoor, who resides at 6800 Frankstown Avenue, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15208.

3. Complainant was hired by the Respondent in July, 1971, to work with Mr. Austin, who was then Assistant Property Manager of Respondent's real estate company. (T. 8, 25)

4. When Mr. Austin was fired, Complainant was asked to instruct the new Assistant Property Manager, Mr. Blasia. (T. 10, 47)

5. One week after Mr. Blasia was hired, Complainant told Respondent that she did not want to teach Mr. Blasia because he was making so much more money than she. (T. 19)

6. At the time of this colloquy, Complainant was being paid \$90.00 per week and Mr. Blasia was being paid \$100.00 per week. (T. 41-42)

7. Complainant subsequently had several heated discussions with Mr. Blasia in the presence of others. (T. 14)

8. Respondent had a problem with Complainant's coming to work late, and leaving work early. (T. 43, 50)

9. Respondent also had complaints from customers concerning Complainant. (T. 43-44, 78)

10. A customer, Ruby Upshaw, testified that Complainant assumed a very nasty attitude towards her. (T. 74)

11. Complainant's co-worker, Audrey Harris, testified that Complainant had a snappy attitude and resented taking orders. (T. 64)

12. Respondent had several discussions with Complainant about correcting her attitude. (T. 60)

13. Respondent finally dismissed Complainant on November 12, 1971. (T. 11)

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

GOVERNOR'S OFFICE

PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

GRACE E. MARTIN :  
Complainant :  
vs : Docket No. E-4563  
IBRAHEEN GHAFOR :  
Respondent :

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Upon all the evidence at the Public Hearing, and upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, the Pennsylvania Human Relations Commission makes the following Conclusions of Law:

1. The Complaint and the Amended Complaint were properly filed by the Complainant, Grace E. Martin.

2. At all times mentioned herein, the Pennsylvania Human Relations Commission had jurisdiction over the Respondent and the subject matter of the Complaint.

3. The terms of employment involving the Complainant and the Complainant's subsequent discharge were not sexually discriminatory actions in violation of Section 5 (a) of the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act.

IT IS, therefore, recommended that the Commission enter an Order dismissing the Complaint against the Respondent, Ibraheem Ghafoor.

---

ROBERT W. GOODE  
Presiding Commissioner

---

JOHN WISNIEWSKI  
Hearing Commissioner

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

GOVERNOR'S OFFICE

PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

GRACE E. MARTIN  
Complainant

vs

IBRAHEEN GHAFOR  
Respondent

:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:  
:

Docket No. E-4563

COMMISSION'S DECISION

AND NOW, this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_,  
1973, upon the recommendation of the Hearing Commissioners and  
upon all the evidence at the Public Hearing of this case, and in  
consideration of the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the  
Pennsylvania Human Relations Commission finds and determines that  
Respondent, Ibraheen Ghafoor, did not engage in any unlawful dis-  
criminatory practice in violation of Section 5 (a) of the  
Pennsylvania Human Relations Act of October 27, 1955, P.L. 744, as  
amended, in that the terms of employment involving the Complainant  
and the Complainant's subsequent discharge were not sexually dis-  
criminatory actions.

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

GOVERNOR'S OFFICE

PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

GRACE E. MARTIN :  
Complainant :  
vs :  
IBRAHEEN GHAFOR :  
Respondent :

Docket No. E-4563

FINAL ORDER

AND NOW, this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_,  
1973, upon consideration of the foregoing Findings of Fact, Con-  
clusions of Law and Commission's Decision, and pursuant to the  
provision of Section 9 of the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act,  
as amended, the Pennsylvania Human Relations Commission hereby  
ORDERS that the Respondent has not violated Section 5 (a) of the  
Pennsylvania Human Relations Act, and that the Complaint by  
Grace E. Martin against Ibraheem Ghafoor is dismissed.

PENNSYLVANIA HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION

\_\_\_\_\_  
E. E. SMITH  
Chairman

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
DR. ROBERT JOHNSON SMITH  
Secretary