

PENNSYLVANIA STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Report on Instruction in the Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations

Findings and Recommendations

Conducted Pursuant to Act 70 of 2014

November 2017

State Board of Education

**Ad Hoc Committee on Holocaust, Genocide and
Human Rights Violations Instruction**

Craig Snider, Chairman, Ad Hoc Committee

Carol Aichele, Member, State Board of Education

Sandra Dungee Glenn, Member, State Board of Education

Larry Wittig, Chairman, State Board of Education

**Report on Instruction in the Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations:
Findings and Recommendations**

Table of Contents

Introduction.....1

Findings.....6

Recommendations.....20

Appendix A: Act 70 of 2014 (Section 1554 of the Public School Code).....22

Appendix B: Act 70 Survey.....29

Appendix C: Act 70 Survey Results.....37

Introduction

Act 70 of 2014 was signed into law by Governor Tom Corbett on June 26, 2014. In the legislation, the General Assembly declared that high priority should be placed on educating students to understand the importance of protecting human rights and the potential consequences of unchecked ignorance, discrimination, and persecution. As such, Act 70 strongly encouraged school entities across the Commonwealth to offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and other human rights violations.

While such instruction was not mandated by Act 70, the bill outlined criteria for the delivery of the permitted instruction beginning with the 2015-2016 school year. The legislation called for such instructional offerings to be integrated within social studies and language arts courses of study, while also allowing such instruction to be integrated into other appropriate courses of study.

Act 70 further set forth that instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations shall:

- 1) Be age appropriate;
- 2) Be sequential in its method of study;
- 3) Communicate the connection between national, ethnic, racial or religious intolerance as they pertain to: the breadth of the history of the Holocaust, including the Third Reich dictatorship, concentration camp system, persecution of Jews and non-Jews, Jewish and non-Jewish resistance, and post-World War II trials; the definition, history, response and actions taken in the face of genocide, including the Holocaust and any other genocide perpetrated against humanity, including the Rwandan genocide and other genocides committed in Africa, Asia and Europe; human rights violations; and Anti-Semitism, racism, and the abridgment of civil rights; and

- 4) Communicate the impact of personal responsibility, civic engagement, and societal response within the context of: the breadth of the history of the Holocaust, including the Third Reich dictatorship, concentration camp system, persecution of Jews and non-Jews, Jewish and non-Jewish resistance, and post-World War II trials; the definition, history, response and actions taken in the face of genocide, including the Holocaust and any other genocide perpetrated against humanity, including the Rwandan genocide and other genocides committed in Africa, Asia and Europe; human rights violations; and Anti-Semitism, racism, and the abridgment of civil rights.

The legislation directed the Department of Education (PDE) to take a number of steps to support schools in delivering the instruction encouraged by Act 70. PDE was required to distribute information about appropriate curriculum materials to all school entities. These materials were made available for informational purposes and the selection of curriculum used in the classroom remains a local decision.

PDE also was required to develop curriculum guidelines for the delivery of instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations. The guidelines were prepared in consultation with an Advisory Committee comprised of organizations and individuals that possessed educational expertise and resources related to these topics.

Finally, Act 70 directed PDE to make in-service training programs available to all school entities in the instruction encouraged by the legislation and in the related curriculum guidelines. The Act also set forth a requirement for all school entities to provide professional development programs on the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations for all educators whose teaching responsibilities included courses of study in which such instruction was integrated. This training requirement could be satisfied by participating in a program offered by PDE or another provider.

Following the steps required of PDE to provide support to schools in delivering the encouraged instruction, Act 70 then required the State Board of Education (Board) to conduct a study of the manner in which instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations is offered by school entities in the Commonwealth. The Board was directed to gather information from school entities concerning

whether such instruction is offered; whether PDE's curriculum guidelines are utilized; whether PDE's in-service training programs are utilized; and the manner in which instruction is offered, including the number of hours of instruction offered, the grade levels at which instruction is offered, and the courses within which such instruction is integrated. Act 70 also directed the Board to make recommendations for improvements to the offering of instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations. The study was to be completed following the 2016-2017 school year, but no later than November 30, 2017.

Act 70 further set forth that if the Board's study demonstrates that less than 90 percent of school entities are offering instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations consistent with what is encouraged by the Act, then the Board must promulgate a regulation that requires school entities to offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations consistent with the Act. As defined in Act 70, the term school entity includes school districts, charter schools, regional charter schools, cyber charter schools, intermediate units, and area vocational-technical schools.

The Board appointed an Ad Hoc Committee on Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations Instruction to conduct the work necessary to formulate the report required by Act 70 and to develop a draft report for the consideration of the Board. The Committee was comprised of Craig Snider, Chairman, Carol Aichele, and Sandra Dungee Glenn.

The Committee held a public meeting on September 14, 2016, at which time it received a presentation from Sally Flaherty, PDE's Social Studies Advisor, on the Guidelines for Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations Instruction and an update on the Department's efforts to support schools in the implementation of Act 70. At that meeting, the Committee also reviewed the charge made to the Board in Act 70 and discussed next steps for developing the report required by the legislation. The Committee determined that it would need to survey school entities in order to gather data requested by Act 70 that was not collected elsewhere and requested that PDE provide it with data on participation in Department-sponsored in-service professional development trainings for educators.

At its next public meeting on November 9, 2016, the Committee finalized the design of the Act 70 survey that would be used to gather the necessary data from school entities. Throughout the course of its

work to develop the survey tool, the Committee's Chairman made regular reports to the Board to provide an opportunity for feedback from all members on its design and execution.

An introduction to the survey provided a brief summary of Act 70 and the purpose of the report, as well definitions for the terms Holocaust, human rights, and genocide to provide context for the instructional content that school entities should consider relevant for purposes of their survey responses. The definitions presented in the survey's introduction were consistent with the definitions used in PDE's curriculum guidelines.

The first question on the survey asked school entities whether they offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. The second question contained two parts that asked school entities whether their chief school administrator was aware of the curriculum guidelines developed by PDE in response to Act 70 and whether school entities utilized those curriculum guidelines.

The third question sought to gather information requested by Act 70 about the grade levels at which instruction is offered and the courses of study in which that instruction is integrated. School entities were asked to identify each grade level (kindergarten through grade 12) in which instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations is offered. The response for each individual grade level included a drop-down menu that sought information specific to that grade level on whether instruction is offered through English Language Arts, Social Studies, assemblies, field trips, or other means. For school entities that do not serve all grade levels or do not provide instruction related to Act 70 in certain grade levels, the response for each grade level also included options to select either "Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity" or "Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level."

Question 4 sought information on the total number of hours of instruction per school year that school entities provide instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations in the following grade level bands: Kindergarten – Grade 4, Grades 5-8, and Grades 9-12. Each grade level band included a drop-down menu with ranges of hours from which school entities could identify the amount of time spent on instruction relevant to Act 70. The following ranges were presented in the drop-down menus: 1-10, 11-20, 21-30, 31-40, 41-50, 51-60, 61-70, 71-80, 81-90, 91-100, 100+. The drop-down

menu also included options to select either “Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity” or “Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level.”

The survey included a final question that sought feedback from school entities on supports for providing the instruction encouraged by Act 70. The three-part question was optional for respondents. The question asked whether educators in the responding school entity are aware of the curriculum materials and resources available to them on the Department of Education’s Standards Align System website, whether educators in the responding school entity are aware that the Department’s Social Studies Advisor is available to provide professional development related to Act 70, and requested feedback on how PDE can further support school entities in including Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations instruction in their curriculum.

The survey was conducted electronically through PDE’s Sharepoint tool. Staff submitting data on behalf of school entities were required to register with the Board in order to be granted secure access to the survey instrument.

The Committee held its final meeting on November 8, 2017, to review the survey results, discuss potential recommendations for improving the offering of instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations, and adopt a draft report for review and consideration by the Board. The Board considered and approved the report and recommendations on November 9, 2017.

Findings

Act 70 directed school entities to provide information related to instruction provided in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations to the Board upon its request. As defined in Act 70, school entities included school districts, charter schools, regional charter schools, cyber charter schools, intermediate units, and area vocational-technical schools. The Board sent survey requests to the 775 school entities operating in the Commonwealth during the 2016-2017 school year (500 school districts, 150 charter schools, 13 cyber charter schools, 10 regional charter schools, 29 Intermediate Units, and 73 area vocational-technical schools (AVTSs), including 63 occupational AVTSs and 10 comprehensive AVTSs). School entities were asked to respond to the survey based on the instruction provided to students during the 2016-2017 school year.

For the purpose of determining whether school entities are providing instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations as encouraged by Act 70, the Board then defined a population of 710 school entities that were directly relevant to this assessment. This figure represents the total number of school entities adjusted to reflect where students receive their academic instruction and to eliminate duplication in the population of school entities identified in Act 70 as described below.

The population of 710 school entities identified for review does not include the 63 occupational AVTSs in the Commonwealth that provide only part-time career and technical instruction. Students enrolled in occupational AVTSs receive academic instruction from their school districts of residence. Thus, the assessment of whether students enrolled in occupational AVTSs are receiving instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations is appropriately reflected in data submitted by the school districts that provide academic instruction to these same students. The population of 710 school entities also does not include the Bryn Athyn School District as Bryn Athyn does not directly operate any schools. Finally, the School District of Philadelphia Intermediate Unit #26 was excluded from the school entities identified for review. The School District of Philadelphia serves as its own Intermediate Unit and already is accounted for in the survey responses submitted by school districts. Thus, including Intermediate Unit #26 as a separate entity for the purposes of this assessment would be duplicative.

The Board received responses to its Act 70 Survey from 688 of the 710 school entities identified for review¹. Responses to the Board's survey were received from 493 school districts, 136 charter schools, 13 cyber charter schools, 9 regional charter schools, 28 Intermediate Units, and 9 comprehensive AVTS².

The first question included on the survey asked school entities whether they offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. Of the 688 responses reviewed by the Board, 660 school entities responded in the affirmative that they offered such instruction during the 2016-2017 school year. Thus, the Board found that 93% of the 710 school entities identified for review do offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations to their students.

Twenty-eight school entities responded that they do not offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. Among that group were 14 charter schools, 1 cyber charter school, 1 regional charter school, 10 Intermediate Units, and 2 school districts^{3,4}.

¹ An additional 56 responses were received from occupational AVTSs, but were not included in the assessment of instruction provided in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations as students enrolled in those schools receive their academic instruction in their school districts of residence.

² The Bryn Athyn School District was excluded from the population of school entities identified for review and is among the seven school districts that did not respond to the Act 70 survey. Further, Intermediate Unit #26 was excluded from the population of school entities identified for review because it is duplicative to the School District of Philadelphia. Thus, the submission of responses to the Act 70 survey from 28 Intermediate Units (I.U.s), coupled with the submission of a response from the Philadelphia School District, reflects a 100 percent response rate from I.U.s.

³ The Duquesne City School District and the Wilkesburg School District submitted responses to the Act 70 survey indicating that they do not provide instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. Both Duquesne and Wilkesburg provide instruction for their students of residence through grade 6 only. Wilkesburg students in grades 7-12 attend the Pittsburgh Westinghouse Academy, a school within the Pittsburgh Public Schools. Duquesne students in grades 7-12 attend either the East Allegheny School District or the West Mifflin School District. Further, while Duquesne indicated in its response to question #1 that it does not provide such instruction, its responses to question #3 of the survey indicates that the district does offer related instruction to the kindergarten through sixth grades students in its direct custody, but does not provide related instruction to its resident students who are enrolled in middle schools and high schools operated by neighboring school districts.

⁴ I.U.s are regional educational service agencies. The services provided by each I.U. vary depending on the needs of the schools in each service region. Not all I.U.s deliver services that would require the integration of curriculum in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations.

Act 70 also directed the Board to gather information on the number of school entities utilizing the Department's Guidelines for Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations Education that were developed as a voluntary resource per Act 70. Of the 688 school entities that responded to the survey, 646 reported that their chief school administrators were aware of the curriculum guidelines and 42 school entities reported that their chief school administrators were not aware of the guidelines. Use of these non-mandatory guidelines was mixed with 340 school entities responding that they utilize the guidelines and 348 school entities responding that they do not.

The Board also surveyed school entities for information about the manner in which they are delivering instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. First, the Board sought information on whether relevant instruction is offered at each grade level and, if offered, the courses of study into which the instruction is integrated. Aggregate responses are presented in the tables below by grade level.

The first table for each grade level identifies whether related instruction is provided at that grade level⁵. The second table for each grade level identifies the manner and courses of study in which such instruction is integrated by those school entities that offer instruction at the corresponding grade level⁶.

Kindergarten	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	71
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	532
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	85

Kindergarten	
English Language Arts	47
Social Studies	47
Assemblies	19
Field Trips	7
Other	17

⁵ Not all school entities included in the survey serve all grades from kindergarten through grade 12.

⁶ School entities may deliver relevant instruction through more than one course of study. Therefore, the total figure for the manner and courses of study in which instruction is integrated may exceed the total number of school entities that provide instruction at each grade level.

Grade 1	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	82
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	525
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	81

Grade 1	
English Language Arts	50
Social Studies	61
Assemblies	23
Field Trips	7
Other	18

Grade 2	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	92
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	513
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	83

Grade 2	
English Language Arts	62
Social Studies	77
Assemblies	26
Field Trips	8
Other	19

Grade 3	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	154
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	451
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	83

Grade 3	
English Language Arts	107
Social Studies	108
Assemblies	30
Field Trips	14
Other	24

Grade 4	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	197
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	412
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	79

Grade 4	
English Language Arts	130
Social Studies	146
Assemblies	32
Field Trips	17
Other	27

Grade 5	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	288
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	328
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	72

Grade 5	
English Language Arts	200
Social Studies	222
Assemblies	43
Field Trips	17
Other	33

Grade 6	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	364
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	256
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	68

Grade 6	
English Language Arts	231
Social Studies	286
Assemblies	49
Field Trips	25
Other	33

Grade 7	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	406
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	216
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	66

Grade 7	
English Language Arts	268
Social Studies	338
Assemblies	53
Field Trips	26
Other	32

Grade 8	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	526
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	96
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	66

Grade 8	
English Language Arts	415
Social Studies	405
Assemblies	76
Field Trips	63
Other	44

Grade 9	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	479
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	106
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	103

Grade 9	
English Language Arts	277
Social Studies	437
Assemblies	64
Field Trips	51
Other	52

Grade 10	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	534
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	56
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	98

Grade 10	
English Language Arts	308
Social Studies	502
Assemblies	68
Field Trips	73
Other	50

Grade 11	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	518
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	69
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	101

Grade 11	
English Language Arts	270
Social Studies	488
Assemblies	68
Field Trips	86
Other	63

Grade 12	
Instruction is offered at this grade level	468
Related instruction is not offered at this grade level	117
Not applicable (grade level is not offered at this school entity)	103

Grade 12	
English Language Arts	249
Social Studies	421
Assemblies	63
Field Trips	85
Other	71

The Act 70 survey also sought information on the number of hours that instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations is provided by school entities in the following grade level bands: Kindergarten – Grade 4, Grades 5-8, and Grades 9-12. School entities were provided with ranges of hours from which to select in responding to this question. The survey findings related to hours of instruction are provided in the three table below for each grade level band.

Hours of Instruction: Kindergarten – Grade 4	
1 – 10	177
11 – 20	52
21 – 30	13
31 – 40	12
41 – 50	4
51 – 60	1
61 – 70	2
71 – 80	1
81 – 90	1
91 – 100	0
100+	1
Not applicable (grade levels not offered at this school entity)	90
Related instruction is not offered at these grade levels	334

Hours of Instruction: Grades 5 – 8	
1 – 10	148
11 – 20	150
21 – 30	98
31 – 40	58
41 – 50	45
51 – 60	23
61 – 70	9
71 – 80	11
81 – 90	6
91 – 100	9
100+	25
Not applicable (grade levels not offered at this school entity)	44
Related instruction is not offered at these grade levels	62

Hours of Instruction: Grades 9 – 12	
1 – 10	57
11 – 20	125
21 – 30	94
31 – 40	72
41 – 50	57
51 – 60	37
61 – 70	30
71 – 80	15
81 – 90	16
91 – 100	20
100+	65
Not applicable (grade levels not offered at this school entity)	90
Related instruction is not offered at these grade levels	10

In addition to gathering data about instructional delivery in the classroom, Act 70 also directed the Board to gather information on the number of school entities using PDE's in-service training programs on the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations instruction and PDE's related curriculum guidelines. While the legislation required the Department to offer this training to all school entities, it did not mandate that school entities participate in the trainings. Between July 2015 and July 2017, PDE delivered 45 trainings on Act 70 across the Commonwealth.

Data on in-service training programs was provided to the Board by the Department and reflects participation in trainings offered between July 2015 and July 2017. During that timeframe, educators from 341 public school entities attended the in-service trainings offered per Act 70. The Department also welcomed participation in these trainings by private and non-public schools. During that same period, educators from 194 private and non-public schools also attended the trainings. As requested by Act 70, the following is a list of the public school entities that utilized the Department's in-service training programs.

**School Entities that Utilized the Department of Education's Act 70
In-Service Training Programs**

Abington Heights School District	Brownsville Area School District
Abington School District	Bucks County Intermediate Unit #22
Albert Gallatin Area School District	Burgettstown Area School District
Allegheny Intermediate Unit Alternative Education Program	Burrell School District
Allegheny Valley School District	Cambria Heights School District
Allentown School District	Cameron County School District
Altoona Area School District	Canon-McMillan School District
Annville-Cleaona School District	Capital Area Intermediate Unit #15
Antietam School District	Carlisle Area School District
Armstrong School District	Carmichaels Area School District
Arts Academy Charter Middle School	Catasauqua Area School District
Athens Area School District	Centennial School District
Austin Area School District	Center for Student Learning Charter School
Avon Grove Charter School	Central Bucks School District
Avonworth School District	Central Cambria School District
Bald Eagle Area School District	Central Dapuhin School District
Baldwin-Whitehall School District	Central Fulton School District
Beaver Area Academic Charter School	Central Valley School District
Beaver Area School District	Central York School District
Beaver Valley Intermediate Unit #27	Chambersburg Area School District
Bedford Area School District	Charleroi School District
Belle Vernon Area School District	Chartiers-Houston School District
Bellefonte Area School District	Cheltenham School District
Bellwood-Antis School District	Chichester School District
Bensalem Township School District	Clairton City School District
Berks County Intermediate Unit	Clarion Area School District
Bermudian Springs School District	Claysburg-Kimmel School District
Bethel Park School District	Clearfield Area School District
Bethlehem Area School District	Cocalico School District
Bethlehem-Center School District	Colonial School District
Blackhawk School District	Columbia-Mountour AVTS High School
Blacklick Valley School District	Commonwealth Connections Academy School
BLaST Intermediate Unit #17	Conemaugh Valley School District
Blue Mountain School District	Conewago Valley School District
Boyertown Area School District	Conrad Weiser Area School District
Bradford Area School District	Cornell School District
Brandywine Heights Area School District	Cornwall-Lebanon School District
Brentwood Borough School District	Coudersport Area School District
Bristol Borough School District	Council Rock School District
Brockway Area School District	Crawford Central School District

Crestwood School District	General McLane School District
Cumberland Perry Area Vocational Technical School	Gettysburg Area School District
Cumberland Valley School District	Governor Mifflin School District
Dallas School District	Great Valley School District
Dallastown Area School District	Greater Johnstown School District
Daniel Boone Area School District	Greencastle-Antrim School District
Derry Area School District	Greenwood School District
Derry Township School District	Girard School District
Discovery Charter School	Halifax Area School District
Donegal School District	Hamburg Area School District
Downingtown Area School District	Hampton Township School District
Dunmore School District	Hanover Area School District
East Penn School District	Hanover Public School District
East Pennsboro Area School District	Harbor Creek School District
Eastern Center for Arts and Technology High School	Harmony Area School District
Eastern Lancaster County School District	Hempfield Area School District
Eastern Lebanon County School District	Hatboro-Horsham School District
Eastern York School District	Hazleton Area School District
Easton Area School District	Highlands School District
Elizabeth Forward School District	Hollidaysburg Area School District
Elizabethtown Area School District	Homer-Center School District
Elk Lake School District	Hopewell Area School District
Ellwood City Area School District	Huntingdon Area School District
Ephrata Area School District	Indiana Area School District
Erie City School District	Independence Charter School
Esperanza Academy Charter School	Intermediate Unit #1
Everett Area School District	Jeannette City School District
Exeter Township School District	Jersey Shore Area School District
Fairfield Area School District	Jim Thorpe Area School District
Fairview School District	Johnsonburg Area School District
Fannett Metal School District	Juniata County School District
Fell Charter School	Juniata Valley School District
Ferndale Area School District	Kane Area School District
Fleetwood Area School District	Keystone Central School District
Folk Arts Cultural Treasures Charter School	KIPP Academy Charter School
Forbes Road School District	Lackawanna Trail School District
Forest City Regional School District	Lake-Lehman School District
Forest Hills School District	Laurel Highlands School District
Fort Cherry School District	Lebanon School District
Fox Chapel Area School District	Lehigh Learning Achievement School
Franklin Area School District	Lehighton Area School District
Freedom Area School District	Lenape Technical High School
Frيره Charter School	Lincoln Intermediate Unit #12
Galeton Area School District	Lincoln Park Performing Arts Charter School

Littlestown Area School District
Lower Dauphin School District
Lower Merion School District
Lower Moreland Township School District
Mahanoy City School District
Manheim Township School District
Marion Center Area School District
Maritime Academy Charter School
Marple Newtown School District
Mars Area School District
MaST Community Charter School
Millcreek Township School District
McGuffey School District
Methacton School District
Meyersdale Area School District
Middletown Area School District
Mifflin County School District
Minersville Area School District
Montgomery Area School District
Montour School District
Morrisville Borough School District
Moshannon Valley School District
Mount Union Area School District
Mt. Lebanon School District
Muncy School District
Neshaminy School District
New Brighton Area School District
New Day Charter School
New Foundations Charter School
Norristown Area School District
North Allegheny School District
North East School District
North Penn School District
North Pocono School District
North Schuylkill School District
North Star School District
Northampton Area School District
Northeast Bradford School District
Northeastern School District
Northern Bedford County School District
Northern Cambria School District
Northern Lebanon School District
Northern Potter School District
Northern Tioga School District

Northern York County School District
Norwin School District
Octorara Area School District
Oley Valley School District
Otto-Eldred School District
Owen J. Roberts School District
PA Learners Online Regional Cyber School
Palisades School District
Palymra Area School District
Panther Valley School District
Parkland School District
Penn Cambria School District
Penn-Delco School District
Penn Hills School District
Penn-Trafford School District
Pennridge School District
Penns Valley Area School District
Pennsbury School District
Pennsylvania Cyber Charter School
Pennsylvania Leadership Charter School
Philadelphia Performing Arts Charter School
Philadelphia School for Arts & Sciences
Philipsburg Osceola Area School District
Pine Grove Area School District
Pine-Richland School District
Pittsburgh Public Schools
Pittston Area School District
Plains Alternative Learning Center
Port Allegany School District
Portage Area School District
Pottsgrove School District
Propel Charter School East
Radnor Township School District
Reading School District
Redbank Valley School District
Renaissance Academy - Edison Charter School
Richland School District
Ridgway Area School District
Ridley School District
Ringgold School District
Riverside Beaver County School District
Riverside School District
Riverview Intermediate Unit #6
Rochester Area School District

Rockwood Area School District	Tredyffrin/Easttown School District
Rose Tree Media School District	Tri-Valley School District
Saint Marys Area School District	Tulpehocken Area School District
Saucon Valley School District	Tunkhannock Area School District
School District of the City of York	Tussey Mountain School District
School District of Lancaster	Twin Valley School District
School District of Philadelphia	Tyrone Area School District
School District of Upper Dublin	Union City Area School District
Schuylkill Haven Area School District	Union School District
Schuylkill Intermediate Unit #29	Upper Adams School District
Schuylkill Technology Center	Upper Merion Area School District
Schuylkill Valley School District	Upper Moreland School District
Scranton School District	Upper St. Clair School District
Seneca Highlands Intermediate Unit #9	Valley Grove School District
Seneca Valley School District	Valley View School District
Shaler Area School District	Wallingford-Swathmore School District
Shanksville-Stonycreek School District	Warwick School District
Sharpsville Area School District	Waynesboro Area School District
Shippensburg Area School District	West Branch Area School District
Smethport Area School District	West Chester Area School District
Somerset Area School District	West Mifflin Area School District
South Allegheny School District	West Side CTC High School
South Eastern School District	West Shore School District
South Park School District	Western Beaver County School District
South Williamsport Area School District	Western Wayne School District
Southeast Delco School District	Westmont Hilltop School District
Southeastern Greene School District	Wilkes-Barre Area School District
Southern Huntingdon County School District	William Penn School District
Southern Lehigh School District	Williams Valley School District
Southern Tioga School District	Williamsburg Community School District
Southern York County School District	Williamsport Area School District
Spring Cove School District	Wilson Area School District
Spring Grove Area School District	Wilson School District
Springfield School District	Winber Area School District
Springfield Township School District	Wissahickon School District
Sto-Rox School District	Wyalusing Area School District
Stroudsburg Area School District	Wyoming Area School District
Sugar Valley Rural Charter School	Wyoming Valley West School District
Sullivan County School District	York Academy Regional Charter School
Susquehanna Community School District	York Suburban School District
Susquehanna Township School District	Yough School District
Susquenita School District	York County School of Technology
Tamaqua Area School District	

In order to further inform its work, the Board included a final three-part question on the Act 70 survey that sought information from school entities beyond the data the Act required the Board to collect. The Board inquired about whether educators in each school entity are aware of the curriculum materials available on PDE's Standards Aligned System, whether educators are aware that PDE's Social Studies Advisor is available to provide professional development on the curriculum guidelines for Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations instruction, and what actions PDE can take to further support school entities in the inclusion of the instruction encouraged by Act 70 in their curriculum.

Responses to this final section of the survey found broad awareness of the resources available on SAS, with 590 school entities reporting that their teachers are aware of this state-level support. There was less awareness of the role PDE can play in directly providing professional development related to Act 70. On the matter of professional development, 381 school entities responded that their educators were aware that PDE's Social Studies Advisor can deliver such training.

School entities also identified enhancing the materials and resources available on SAS and delivering professional development training online as the strongest means through which PDE can support them in delivering the instruction encouraged by Act 70. Enhancing the materials and resources on SAS was identified as an area for further support by 499 school entities and the delivery of online professional development was identified as an area for further support by 469 school entities. In addition, 296 school entities cited on-site professional development as a channel through which PDE can support the implementation of Act 70 and 235 school entities identified the inclusion of a session at PDE's annual SAS Institute as another avenue through which the Department can support the delivery of the instruction encouraged by Act 70.

Recommendations

- The Board encourages all public school entities to continue offering instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations in the manner that is encouraged by Act 70.
- The Board encourages all private and non-public schools to offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations in the manner that is encouraged by Act 70.
- The Board recommends that the Department of Education continue offering in-service training for all Pennsylvania educators on instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations and the Department's related curriculum guidelines.
- The Board recommends that the Department of Education conduct outreach to the school entities that submitted responses to the Act 70 Survey indicating that they do not currently provide instruction in the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations. In conducting this outreach, the Department should relay that both the Board and the General Assembly strongly encourage school entities to incorporate instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations in their curriculum to ensure students are provided with an understanding of the importance of the protection of human rights and the potential consequences of unchecked ignorance, discrimination and persecution. To support school entities in accomplishing this, the Department should provide information to these school entities on its related curriculum guidelines, trainings, and resources available on the Standards Aligned System portal to ensure these school entities are aware of the state-level resources available to support them in delivering age-appropriate instruction as encouraged by Act 70.
- The Board recommends that the Department of Education maintain the Advisory Committee on Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations instruction that was convened in 2014 following

the passage of Act 70 and that the Department continue utilizing these expert resources in the development and delivery of future in-service training programs and resource materials for school entities.

- The Board recommends that the Department of Education enhance the curriculum resources related to the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations that are available on the Standards Aligned System website. Responses to the Act 70 survey provided by school entities indicates that SAS could be strengthened by: adding more elementary-level content on civil rights/human rights; adding more secondary-level content on genocides other than the Holocaust; identifying potential field trips; including a directory of potential speakers and partner organizations available to conduct school assemblies; providing access to video interviews with primary sources; and providing resources on how to incorporate this instruction into content areas other than Social Studies and English Language Arts.
- The Board encourages public school entities and private and non-public schools to invite speakers to share accounts of experiences related to the Holocaust, genocide, and human rights violations (i.e.: Holocaust survivors, children of survivors, liberators, children of liberators).

APPENDIX A

Act 70 of 2014

SENATE AMENDED

PRIOR PRINTER'S NOS. 1858, 1940, 2766

PRINTER'S NO. 3712

THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF PENNSYLVANIA

HOUSE BILL

No. 1424 Session of
2013

INTRODUCED BY CLYMER, TURZAI, BARRAR, KOTIK, V. BROWN, O'BRIEN,
O'NEILL, STEPHENS, MCGEEHAN, KORTZ, PARKER, PETRI,
SCHLOSSBERG, COHEN, RAPP, YOUNGBLOOD, DENLINGER, ROCK,
GINGRICH, GOODMAN, MAHONEY, PAINTER, MICOZZIE, WATSON, HESS,
GROVE, FLECK, MURT, TALLMAN, DAVIS, NEILSON, SIMS,
OBERLANDER, FRANKEL, CALTAGIRONE, BRADFORD AND BRIGGS,
MAY 23, 2013

AS AMENDED ON THIRD CONSIDERATION, IN SENATE, JUNE 10, 2014

AN ACT

Amending the act of March 10, 1949 (P.L.30, No.14), entitled "An act relating to the public school system, including certain provisions applicable as well to private and parochial schools; amending, revising, consolidating and changing the laws relating thereto," in terms and courses of study, providing for Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations instruction.

THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY FINDS AND DECLARES AS FOLLOWS:

(1) TO PROVIDE CHILDREN WITH AN UNDERSTANDING OF THE IMPORTANCE OF THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE POTENTIAL CONSEQUENCES OF UNCHECKED IGNORANCE, DISCRIMINATION

AND PERSECUTION, IT IS A MATTER OF HIGH PRIORITY THAT CHILDREN IN THIS COMMONWEALTH BE EDUCATED CONCERNING THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND OTHER HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS.

(2) THEREFORE, THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY STRONGLY ENCOURAGES SCHOOL ENTITIES IN THIS COMMONWEALTH TO OFFER INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND OTHER HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS.

The General Assembly of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania hereby enacts as follows:

Section 1. The act of March 10, 1949 (P.L.30, No.14), known as the Public School Code of 1949, is amended by adding a section to read:

Section 1554. Holocaust, Genocide and Human Rights Violations Instruction.--(a) (1) Beginning with school year 2015-2016, each school entity ~~may~~ SHALL MAY offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations to students. ~~If offered by the school entity, the.~~ THE instruction shall be integrated within the social studies and language arts courses of study required in accordance with State Board of Education regulations. Instruction may also be integrated into other appropriate courses of study.

(2) The Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations instruction permitted pursuant to paragraph (1) shall:

(i) Be age appropriate.

(ii) Be sequential in method of study.

(iii) Communicate the connection between national, ethnic, racial or religious intolerance and the subjects described in subsection (b).

(iv) Communicate the impact of personal responsibility, civic engagement and societal response within the context of the subjects described in subsection (b).

(3) School entities may utilize any appropriate public or private materials, personnel and other resources in developing and implementing the program of instruction permitted pursuant to paragraph (1). The Department of Education shall make available DISTRIBUTE information about appropriate curriculum materials upon request of a TO EACH school entity. School entities that offer the instruction permitted pursuant to paragraph (1) may utilize any curriculum that complies with the requirements of this subsection.

(b) (1) The Department of Education shall establish curriculum guidelines no later than twelve (12) months after the effective date of this section. The guidelines shall encourage the inclusion of all of the following subjects where appropriate in the instruction:

(i) The breadth of the history of the Holocaust, including the Third Reich dictatorship, concentration camp system, persecution of Jews and non-Jews, Jewish and non-Jewish resistance and post-World War II trials.

(ii) The definition, history, response and actions taken in the face of genocide, including the Holocaust and any other genocide perpetrated against humanity, INCLUDING THE RWANDAN GENOCIDE AND OTHER GENOCIDES COMMITTED IN AFRICA, ASIA AND EUROPE.

(iii) Human rights violations.

(iv) Anti-Semitism, racism and the abridgment of civil rights.

(2) The Department of Education ~~may~~ SHALL work in consultation with organizations AND INDIVIDUALS that provide educational EXPERTISE AND resources related to the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations to develop the curriculum guidelines. THE GUIDELINES SHALL STATE THE MINIMUM AMOUNT OF INSTRUCTION NECESSARY TO ADEQUATELY EDUCATE STUDENTS ON THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS.

(c) Beginning with the 2015-2016 school year, the Department of Education shall make available, to all school entities, in-service training programs based upon the instruction ~~permitted~~ REQUIRED pursuant to PROVIDED FOR UNDER subsection (a) and the curriculum guidelines established pursuant to subsection (b).

(d) (1) Beginning with the 2015-2016 school year, each school entity ~~that offers the instruction permitted pursuant to subsection (a)~~ PROVIDING INSTRUCTION UNDER SUBSECTION (A) shall provide, as part of its in-service training, programs on the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations for all instructors whose teaching responsibilities include courses of study in which instruction concerning the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations is integrated. A school entity may utilize the programs made available by the Department of Education or use other alternative programs that are consistent with the provisions of this section.

(2) Employes required to complete continuing professional education under section 1205.2 shall receive credit toward the

continuing professional education requirements where the training program provided pursuant to paragraph (1) has been approved by the Department of Education.

(e) The Department of Education shall provide the guidelines, in-service training and any other materials developed in accordance with this section to any nonpublic school within this Commonwealth upon receiving a request from the nonpublic school.

~~(f) The State Board of Education shall adopt rules and~~

(F) THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION SHALL:

(1) CONDUCT A STUDY REGARDING THE MANNER IN WHICH INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS IS OFFERED BY SCHOOL ENTITIES IN THIS COMMONWEALTH. IN CONDUCTING THE STUDY, THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION SHALL REQUEST THAT EACH SCHOOL ENTITY PROVIDE THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION WITH INFORMATION CONCERNING WHETHER THE SCHOOL ENTITY OFFERS SUCH INSTRUCTION AND THE MANNER IN WHICH SUCH INSTRUCTION IS OFFERED. EACH SCHOOL ENTITY SHALL PROVIDE INFORMATION TO THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION IN RESPONSE TO A REQUEST UNDER THIS PARAGRAPH. FOLLOWING THE 2016-2017 SCHOOL YEAR, BUT NOT LATER THAN NOVEMBER 30, 2017, THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION SHALL ISSUE A REPORT TO THE GOVERNOR, THE SECRETARY OF EDUCATION, THE CHAIRMAN AND MINORITY CHAIRMAN OF THE EDUCATION COMMITTEE OF THE SENATE AND THE CHAIRMAN AND MINORITY CHAIRMAN OF THE EDUCATION COMMITTEE OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES ADDRESSING THE FOLLOWING:

(I) THE NUMBER OF SCHOOL ENTITIES OFFERING

INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS.

(II) THE NUMBER OF SCHOOL ENTITIES USING THE CURRICULUM GUIDELINES ESTABLISHED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION UNDER SUBSECTION (B).

(III) THE NUMBER OF SCHOOL ENTITIES USING THE IN-SERVICE TRAINING PROGRAMS MADE AVAILABLE BY THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION UNDER SUBSECTION (C).

(IV) A DESCRIPTION OF THE MANNER IN WHICH SCHOOL ENTITIES ARE OFFERING INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS, INCLUDING THE NUMBER OF HOURS OF INSTRUCTION OFFERED, THE GRADE LEVELS AT WHICH SUCH INSTRUCTION IS OFFERED AND THE COURSE WITHIN SUCH INSTRUCTION IS INTEGRATED.

(V) THE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENTS TO THE OFFERING OF INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS, INCLUDING RECOMMENDED LEGISLATION.

(2) ADOPT A REGULATION, PURSUANT TO THE ACT OF JUNE 25, 1982 (P.L.633, NO.181), KNOWN AS THE "REGULATORY REVIEW ACT," TO REQUIRE SCHOOL ENTITIES TO OFFER INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH SUBSECTIONS (A) AND (B), IF THE STUDY CONDUCTED BY THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION UNDER PARAGRAPH (1) DEMONSTRATES THAT LESS THAN NINETY PERCENT OF THE SCHOOL ENTITIES ARE OFFERING INSTRUCTION IN THE HOLOCAUST, GENOCIDE AND HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS CONSISTENT WITH SUBSECTIONS (A)

AND (B).

(3) ADOPT RULES AND regulations necessary for the implementation of this section pursuant to the act of June 25, 1982 (P.L.633, No.181), known as the "Regulatory Review Act."

(g) For purposes of this section, the term "school entity" shall mean a school district, charter school, regional charter school, cyber charter school, intermediate unit or area vocational-technical school.

Section 2. This act shall take effect in 60 days.

APPENDIX B

Act 70 Survey

Act 70 of 2014 added language to Section 1554 of the Public School Code that permits, but does not require, school entities to offer instruction to students in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations. Per Section 1554, such instruction shall be integrated within the social studies and language arts courses of study. Instruction also may be integrated into other appropriate courses of study.

Per Act 70, the State Board of Education is required to conduct this survey of how instruction is offered in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations by school entities in the Commonwealth. For the purposes of this survey, school entities include school districts, charter schools, regional charter schools, cyber charter schools, intermediate units and area vocational-technical schools.

Consistent with the curriculum guidelines developed by the Department of Education in response to Act 70, instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations shall mean instruction that includes content related to the following as defined in the guidelines:

Holocaust: *“The Holocaust was the systematic, bureaucratic, state-sponsored persecution and murder of approximately six million Jews by the Nazi regime and its collaborators. During the era of the Holocaust, German authorities also targeted other groups because of their perceived “racial inferiority”: Roma (Gypsies), the disabled, and some of the Slavic people (Poles, Russians, and others). Other groups were persecuted on political, ideological, and behavioral grounds, among them Communists, Socialists, Jehovah’s Witnesses, and homosexuals.” (United States Holocaust Memorial Museum)*

Human rights: *“Human rights are rights inherent to all human beings, whatever our nationality, place of residence, sex, national or ethnic origin, color, religion, language, or any other status. We are all equally entitled to our human rights without discrimination. These rights are all interrelated, interdependent and indivisible.” (Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the United Nations)*

Genocide: *Genocide is defined by the United Nations in Article 2 of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (1948) “[A]ny of the following acts committed with intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, as such:*

- 1. Killing members of the group;*
- 2. Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group;*
- 3. Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part;*
- 4. Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group;*
- 5. Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group. (United Nations Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide.)”*

To inform the study required by Act 70, please provide responses to the following survey questions relevant to the instruction offered by your school entity during the 2016-2017 school year.

Responses to the following survey questions should be returned electronically using the SharePoint survey link provided to you. This hard copy of the survey questions is being shared for planning purposes.

Please respond to the survey questions in the context of instruction provided during the 2016-17 school year.

Name of School Entity:

Role of School Entity:

- School District
- Charter School
- Cyber Charter School
- Regional Charter School
- Intermediate Unit
- Area Vocational-Technical School

1. Does your school entity offer instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations?

YES / NO (via drop-down menu)

2. (a) Is the chief school administrator of your school entity aware of the curriculum guidelines for Holocaust, genocide and human rights violation education that were developed by the Department of Education in response to Act 70 and published in July 2015?

YES / NO (via drop-down menu)

(b) Although not mandated by Act 70, does your school entity utilize the curriculum guidelines for Holocaust, genocide and human rights violation education that were developed by the Department of Education in response to Act 70 and published in July 2015?

YES / NO (via drop-down menu)

3. The State Board of Education understands and appreciates the need for this subject matter to be age-appropriate. Please indicate the grade levels in which your school entity offers instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations and the manner or courses of study in which such instruction is offered. For the related courses of study, please select all that apply at each grade level.

Kindergarten

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

1st Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

2nd Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

3rd Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

4th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other

Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

5th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other

Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

6th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other

Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

7th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other

Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

8th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other

Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

9th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies

Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

10th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

11th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

12th Grade

English Language Arts
Social Studies
Assemblies
Field Trips
Other
Not applicable: grade level not offered at this school entity
Not applicable: related instruction not offered at this grade level

4. On average, how many total hours of instruction, per school year, is offered in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations by your school entity in the following grade level bands:

Kindergarten – Grade 4

0

1-10

11-20

21-30

31-40

41-50

51-60

61-70

71-80

81-90

91-100

100+

Not applicable: grade levels not offered at this school entity

Not applicable: related instruction not offered at these grade levels

Grades 5-8

0

1-10

11-20

21-30

31-40

41-50

51-60

61-70

71-80

81-90

91-100

100+

Not applicable: grade levels not offered at this school entity

Not applicable: related instruction not offered at these grade levels

Grades 9-12

0

1-10

11-20

21-30

31-40

41-50

51-60

61-70

71-80

81-90

91-100

100+

Not applicable: grade levels not offered at this school entity

Not applicable: related instruction not offered at these grade levels

5. The following questions pertain to supports available for instruction in the Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations and its implementation.

(a) Do educators in your school entity know that materials and resources for inclusion in the curriculum are available on the SAS website (www.PDESAS.org)?

YES / NO (via drop-down menu)

(b) Do educators in your school entity know that the Department of Education's Social Studies Advisor is available to provide professional development on the adopted curriculum guidelines to your school staff?

YES / NO (via drop-down menu)

- (c) Please provide feedback on how the Pennsylvania Department of Education can further support your district in inclusion of Holocaust, genocide and human rights violations in the curriculum. (Select all that apply.)

Drop-down menu:

Enhanced materials and resources on SAS

Professional development provided by the Department of Education on-site

Professional development provided by the Department of Education online

SAS Institute Session

Other (NARRATIVE RESPONSE AREA – OPTIONAL)

APPENDIX C

Act 70 Survey Responses

A full set of responses to the Act 70 survey is published as a separate document due to the volume of the survey responses.